

**Vinaya Elements in Āgama Texts
as a Criterion of the School Affiliation**
— Taking the Six *vivādamūlas* as an Example —

Jin-il Chung

(Sanskrit-Wörterbuch, Göttingen Academy of Sciences and Humanities,
Germany)

국문요약

동투르크스탄 출토의 아함전적과 소위 근본설일체유부울 중에 포함된 아함구절은 약간의 용어상의 차이를 제외하고는 대체로 일치하는 반면, 율전의 경우 양자의 사이에 상당한 차이가 보인다. 이러한 상황은 학자들로 하여금 두 부파는 각기 다른 율장을 계승하였으나, 동일 아함을 공유하였다고 상정하게 하였다. 그러나 동투르크스탄본 아함전적과 근본설일체유부울의 일치하는 후자에 포함된 아함인용구 내지는 설화적 구절에 한정되지 않은 듯하다. 동투르크스탄 출토 산스크리트 사본단편을 토대로 복원된 衆集經 중에 六靜本에

관한 구절이 있다. 이 구절은 길기트본 滅諍事 중에 포함된 해당 구절과 현저하게 닮아있음을 간과할 수 없다. 이 정도의 유사성은 십송율과 근본설일체유부율 사이에 찾아볼 수 없다. 이러한 관점에서 보아 동투르키스탄에서 발견된 아함전적을 전승한 불교인들은 십송율보다는 오히려 근본설일체유부율과 유사한 율장을 계승하였다고 상정해 보는 것은 솔깃한 일이다. 양종의 율장이 동투르키스탄에 존재하였음이 입증된 이상 동투르키스탄 출토의 아함전적 과 십송율을 포함한 소위 설일체유부율 사이의 관계는 재고할 필요가 있다고 본다.

주제어: 六諍本, 설일체유부, 근본설일체유부, 律, 阿舍, 동투르키스탄, 길기트

1. General Remarks

Discussions on the Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda works have often focused on the differences in diction between the Sanskrit versions of the Āgama texts, namely those from the Northern Silk Road of Eastern Turkestan and those contained in the so-called Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya from Gilgit, Pakistan. Thereby the general consensus of opinion seems to have been that the Sanskrit Vinaya texts from Eastern Turkestan, which show congruency with the Shisong-lü (十誦律), derive from the same Buddhist school as the Āgama texts found in the same region. The Āgama texts from Eastern Turkestan and those contained in the so-called Mūlasarvā-

stivāda Vinaya from Gilgit are, apart from differences in diction, by and large congruent, whereas the Vinaya texts differ from each other considerably. This circumstance has led scholars to assume that the two Buddhist schools possessed their own Vinaya traditions, but shared an Āgama tradition. The latter seems to be supported through the new Āgama find from Gilgit.¹⁾

The Za-ahanjing (雜阿含經), i.e. the Chinese translation of the Saṃyuktāgama by Guṇabhadra, supposedly derives from the same tradition as the so-called Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya. This assumption is also supported through comparative studies of the former with the Vinaya texts of different traditions. And so we may safely infer that the Buddhists who passed down the Za-ahanjing were very closely related to, or were the same as, those who passed down the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya. On the other hand, a comparison of the sūtras preserved in the Shisong-lü with those in the Za-ahanjing and the Sanskrit parallels from Eastern Turkestan as well as Gilgit seems to suggest that the Shisong-lü derives from a textual tradition different from that of the other three. This view is corroborated through further passages in the Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra of the Dīrghāgama containing the story of the ‘Cremation of Buddha’s Body

1) On this manuscript find, cf. J.-U. Hartmann, “Bemerkungen zu einer neuen Handschrift des Dīrghāgama”, *Vividharatnakaraṇḍaka, Festgabe für Adelheid Mette*, ed. C. Chojnacki et al., Swisttal-Odendorf, 2000 (Indica et Tibetica 37), pp. 359-367; idem, “Further Remarks on the New Manuscript of the Dīrghāgama”, *Journal of the International College for Advanced Buddhist Studies* 5 (2002), pp. 133-150; G. Melzer, *Ein Abschnitt aus dem Dīrghāgama*, München (Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität), 2010 (Inaugural-Dissertation), pp. 1-10.

and Distribution of the Relics'. The story in the Eastern Turkestan version of the Mahāparinirvāṇa-sūtra finds parallels in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya as well as in the Shisong-lü, and is congruent with that preserved in the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya, but shows considerable differences from the Shisong-lü version.

Table 1: Āgama Elements in the Shisong-lü

ShLü	SĀc	Skt.
243c20–244b23	Sū 592; cf. SĀc(2) Sū 186	Samḡhabh I 166.16–171.1; Śay-v 14.13–18.13
445c14–447a11	∅	MPS §§ 48.1–51.27 ²⁾
448b13–449a7	Sū 379	DhCakrP-dh 79–92
445c14–446 a23	Sū 1197	Avś II 197.2–200.6; MPS §§ 32.4–10, 44.1–11, 49.23 f. ³⁾
257b28–258a3	Sū 1064; cf. SĀc(2) Sū 3	Samḡhabh II 70.31–73.2
22a8–23a19	Sū 1075	∅

The congruency between the Sanskrit Āgama texts from Eastern Turkestan and the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya does not seem to have been confined to the Āgama citations, or to the narrative portions. In the Saṅgīti-sūtra reconstructed by V. Stache-Rosen on the basis of Sanskrit fragments from Eastern Turkestan there are passages on the six roots of contention (Skt. *ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni*; Tib. 'gyed pa'i rtsa ba drug).⁴⁾ Stache-Rosen's reconstruction can be corrected

2) Cf. ÜLB pp. 285 ff.; Bareau, Recherches II.2, 215 ff.

3) Cf. Survey(SĀ) p. 228.

4) According to the translation of the Pāli terms in MN II 245.25–247.2 by Ñānamoli

and supplemented through further Sanskrit fragments and the passages restored thus show a striking similarity to the corresponding portion in the Adhikaraṇavastu from Gilgit, a degree of similarity which, to the best of my knowledge, cannot be observed between the Shisong-lü and the so-called Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya.

From this point of view, it is tempting to assume that the Buddhists who passed down the Āgama tradition found in Eastern Turkestan possessed a Vinaya corpus which rather looked like the Vinaya from Gilgit than the Shisong-lü, possibly with specific features in diction corresponding to those of the Āgama texts. Seeing that the existence of both Vinaya traditions has been proven in Eastern Turkestan, admittedly in unequal frequencies for whatever reason, a reconsideration of the relationship between the Āgama texts from Eastern Turkestan and the so-called Sarvāstivāda Vinaya tradition including the Shisong-lü, appears to be indispensable. Neither the Āgama elements preserved in the Shisong-lü seem to indicate a shared origin with the Āgama texts found in Eastern Turkestan, nor do the few Vinaya elements preserved in the latter seem to confirm the assumption that they derive from the same tradition as the Shisong-lü. The affiliation of both text groups to the one and the

(MN(Ñ) 854 f.): 1. being angry and resentful (*kodhana, upanāhin*), 2. being contemptuous and insolent (*makkhīn, paḷāsin*), 3. being envious and avaricious (*issukīn, maccharīn*), 4. being fraudulent and deceitful (*saṭha, māyāvin*), 5. having evil wishes and wrong view (*pāpiccha, micchādīṭṭhīn*), and 6. adhering to his own views, holding on to them tenaciously, and relinquishing them with difficulty (*sandiṭṭhi-parāmāsin, ādhānagāhin, duppaṭinissaggin*).

same Buddhist school seems to be untenable. In the present paper I deem it as a small contribution to this topic to present a restitution of the passage in the Saṅgīti-sūtra concerning the six *vivādamūlas* and a juxtaposition with the counterpart in the Adhikaraṇavastu.

2. The Six *vivādamūlas*: Restitution of the Corresponding Passage in the Saṅgīti-sūtra

2.1. Preliminaries

The passage on the six roots of contention preserved in the Saṅgītisūtra (§ VI.17) and in the Adhikaraṇavastu (Adhik-v(Skt) 72 f.; Adhik-v(Tib) D 246 (461.1 ff.); Q 4 (1.1 ff.)) has its parallel in the following texts:

1. a) Cv 4 Samathakkhandhaka, 14.3 [Vin II 89.5-32]; b) DN 33 Saṅgītisuttanta, 2.2.15 [III 246.9-247.18]; c) MN 104 Sāma-gāmasutta, II 245.25-247.2; d) AN 6.36 [III 334.11-335.26]
2. DĀc 9 衆集經, 51 c26-52 a6
3. MĀc 196 周那經, 753 c11-754 a20
4. T no. 85, vol. 1, 息靜因緣經, 905 b14-c2
5. T no. 1548, vol. 28, 舍利弗阿毘曇論, 653 a2-14
6. VUG gCig las 'phros pa, D 375 (67.3-68.3); Q 131 (5.2)-132 (1.2)⁵⁾

5) A Skt. parallel partly preserved in SC MS 2627/2 [middle] A4-8: transliterated by K. Wille and identified by G. Schopen (kindly forwarded to me by K. Wille).

The Shisong-lü has no corresponding passage but a short list of the six roots of contention (六諍本) in the Ekottarika chapter (ShLü 367 a7-9). The Chinese Vinayamātrkā (T 1441 毘尼摩得勒伽) which adapts to the structure of the Shisong-lü omits the list and refers to the Ekottarika chapter (ibid. 609 b3 f.).

Table 2: Six Roots of Contention in Different Traditions

	ShLü		Saṅg	SaṅgPar	Adhik-v(Skt)	Pāli
1	瞋恨	1	krodhana, upanāhin	忿恨	krodhana, upanāhin	1 kodhana, upanāhin
	不語		∅	∅	∅	∅
2	惡性欲害	2-5	mrakṣin, pradāśin	覆惱	mrakṣin, pradāśin	2 makkhin, paḷāsin
3	貪嫉		īrṣyuka, matsarin	嫉慳	īrṣyaka, matsarin	3 issukin, maccharin
4	諂曲		śaṭha, māyāvin	誑諂	śaṭha, māyāvin	4 saṭha, māyāvin
5	無慚愧		ahrīmat, anavatṛāpin	∅	ahrīmat, anapatṛāpin	∅
6	惡欲		pāpeccha	∅	pāpeccha	5 pāpiccha
	邪見		mithyādrṣṭika	邪見倒見	mithyādrṣṭika	micchādiṭṭhin
		6	svayaṃdrṣṭiparā- marśin	取著自見	svayaṃdrṣṭiparā- marśin	6 sandiṭṭhiparāmāsin
			asamañjasagrāhin	起堅固執	asamañjasagrāhin	ādhānagāhin
			duṣpratinihsarga- mantrin	難教棄捨	duṣpratinihsarga- mantrin	duppaṭinissaggin

T 85: 1. 忿恨; 2. 覆誑諂; 3. 嫉慳; 4. 無慚無愧; 5. 不正知見取等; 6. 諸執著邪妄憶念

DĀc: 1. 好瞋不捨; 2. 恨戾不諱; 3. 慳悻嫉妬; 4. 巧偽虛妄; 5. 自因己見謬受不捨; 6. 迷於邪見與邊見俱

MĀc: 1. 瞋恨者結纏; 2. 不語結; 3. 慳嫉; 4. 諂誑; 5. 無慚無愧; 6. 惡欲邪見惡性不可制

Adhik-v(Tib) ('gyed pa'i rtsa ba drug): 1. khro ba, khon du 'dzin pa; 2. 'chab pa, 'tshig pa; 3. phrag dog, ser sna; 4. g.yo, sgyu; 5. ño tsha med pa, khrel med pa; 6. rañ gi lta ba mchog tu 'dzin pa, 'chal ba 'dzin pa, smras pa la dañ na then byed pa⁶⁾

VUG ('khrug pa'i rtsa ba drug): 1. khro ba, khon du 'dzin pa; 2. 'chab pa, 'tshig pa; 3. phrag dog, 'juñs pa; 4. g.yo, sgyu; 5. ño tsha med pa, mi 'dzem pa; 6. rañ gi lta ba sñem par gyur pa

6) Cf. ŚrBh(T) I 294.5 f. *na ca svayaṃdrṣṭiparāmarśasthāyī bhavaty asamañjasagrāhī duḥpratinihsargamantrī* (Tib. *rañ gi lta ba mchog tu 'dzin pa la gnas par mi byed cin | cal col du mi 'dzin pa dañ | spañ dka' bar mi smra ba yin te*).

2.2. Transliteration of the Sanskrit Fragments

* Among the Sanskrit fragments of the Turfan Finds in Berlin, five small fragments were identified as belonging to the passage in concern and used for the restitution by K. Mittal and V. Stache-Rosen. The catalogue numbers of the Sanskrit fragments are SHT 498, 498b, 610, 611, and 783. Now we know that two further Sanskrit fragments from Eastern Turkestan stem from the same passage, SHT 1559 and Or.15009/91 respectively. In addition, two tiny Sanskrit fragments of a Dīrghāgama manuscript from Gilgit in the “Private Collection, Virginia” (PCV F21.5, G3.1) are identified by K. Wille as belonging to this portion. Here follows a diplomatic transliteration of the remains of the manuscript. On this occasion, I would like to thank Simone Raschmann of the Berlin-Brandenburg Academy of Sciences and Humanities and Jens-Uwe Hartmann of the Ludwig Maximilian University of Munich. Simone Raschmann made the digital photos of the Sanskrit fragments of the Turfan finds and Jens-Uwe Hartmann those in the “Private Collection, Virginia” available to me. I am grateful for their friendly support. The transliteration of the corresponding portion from the Adhikaraṇavastu is based on a facsimile of the manuscript.

** The symbols used for the transliteration and restitution are listed below at the end of the present paper. No notes are made with regard to missing or irregular Sandhis. The same holds true for punctuation marks.

1) SHT 498/4 (FakSHT Tafel 87; also found at <http://idp.bl.uk>,
<http://idp.bbaw.de>)

1. *recto* (Saṅg Ms 73)

4 .. [ḍ] vivādamū
5 /// ○ tyaḥ .[ro]dhano bhavat[y]. + + + + + + + + + +
+ + + + + + .[o]t[i] na [gu]rukaroti [na] .[ānaya]ti na pū
6 /// [n a]gurukurvaṃn amā + [y].n apūja + + + + + + + + + + +
+ + + + + + + + + + + .[ā]ma[ṇy]. [ana]v[e] sa
saṃghe tadrūpa[m]
7 /// [v]igrahavivāda[m yo] bhavati ka[l]. + + + + + + + + + + +
+ + + + + + + + + + + .. ana + + [hi]t[ā]ya duḥkhā[y].
[de]va

2. *verso* (Saṅg Ms 74)

1 /// [v]ādāmūlaṃ [s]. ty ādhyātmaṃ vā bahi[rdh]. + + + + + +
+ + + + + + + + + + + + + + + + [m]. [nai]r a + + + +
mā[naiḥ]s t[ī]vraś ca[nd].
2 /// [ś cā]prātivāni[ś] ca smṛ .[y]. saṃprajan[y]e + + + + + + +
+ + + + + + + + + + + + + + + [t]. : e[v]. .[ū]paṃ yū ..
[v]ivā[da]mūlaṃ sa
3 /// ○ sa[mṃm]. [n]upaśyata ta .. + + + + + + + [m]. + .. + + + + +
+ + + + + + + ..[ṛ] ..r apramādena ca yo[gaḥ] ka .. nīyaḥ
4 /// ○ sa + + [h]. tam ā[y]. .[y].[y]. [t]. : yathā kr[o] + + + +
+ + + + + + + [i]rṣyuko ma[tsa]r[ī] śa[ṭh]o māyāvī ahrī
5 /// ○ .. [a] + + ṅjasagrāhī duṣpratiniḥsargamaṃ[tr]. + + + + +
+ + + + + .. rāma[rśī] a[sam].ṃ .. sa .[r]. .. .uṣpra[tini]

6 /// rva[vad] y[āvad] ā[y]. [ty]. [not]patsyate :

2) Or.15009/91 (BLSF II.2, Plate 98; also found at <http://idp.bl.uk>)

3. *recto*

3 /// + [ṣa]ḍ vivādamūlāni kat. [mā] + ///

4 /// + [pū]jayati sa śāstāram a[s]. + ///

5 /// + + m utpādayati kalahabha + ///

6 /// + [duḥ]kh[ā]ya devamanuṣyāṇām e ///

7 /// + + [m]ān[ai]s tīvraś cchandaś ca vyā[y]. + ///

8 /// + + .ādamūlaṃ saty ādhyāt[m]. + + ///

4. *verso*

1 /// + [ra]ñīyaḥ eva[m] vas ta[d] v[i] + ///

2 /// + .. · svayaṃdṛṣṭiparāma[rś]. + ///

3) SHT 611 (also found at <http://idp.bbaw.de>, <http://idp.bl.uk>)

5. *recto* (Saṅg Ms 77)

3 /// ○ tamāni ṣaṭ* ihaikatyah kr. ///

4 /// ○ .. [j]. .. + .. śāstāram asatku .. ///

5 /// + + + + + + .ut.ā + [ya]ti [k]. + ///

6. *verso* (Saṅg Ms 78)

1 /// + + + + + + + de[v]. + .[u] ///

2 /// ○ + [s]. + + + [s]. [mo]da[m]ā[nais tivr]. ///

3 /// ○ d vivādamūlam utpanna prahā[s]. ///

4 /// ○ samagraiḥ saṃmodamānai[r] . . i + ///

5 /// [h]. [ta]m ā .. [ṃ] .. + + + + + + ///

4) SHT 610 (also found at <http://idp.bbaw.de>, <http://idp.bl.uk>)

7. *recto* (Saṅg Ms 79)

3 /// + .. yo sau krodhano bha[v]. + ///

4 /// + .. yan ap[ū] .. yaṃ [dh]. + + ///

5 /// + + .. + + + + + + ///

8. *verso* (Saṅg Ms 80)

1 /// + + + + + + + + ///

2 /// .. ś cotsā[h]. .[c]. tsu + + ///

3 /// + .. vādamūlaṃ saty ā + + ///

4 /// [t]. sa āra[kṣā] smṛtir apra + + ///

5 /// .. m. + + p[r]. dāśi irṣyuko .. ///

5) SHT 783 (also found at <http://idp.bbaw.de>, <http://idp.bl.uk>)

9. *recto* (Saṅg Ms 81)

3 /// + [n]āhi sa śāstāraṃ na sa[tkar]. t. na ○ ///

4 /// + + + .i + [p]. ś[ya]ṃ śrāmaṇye ana ○ ///

5 /// + + + + + + + + .[i] .ādaḥ [ba] .. ///

10. *verso* (Saṅg Ms 82)

1 /// + + + + + + + + [h] sa[ma] ///

2 /// + + +[m]r̥ .[y]ā sa[m]prajamnyena ca ○ ///

3 /// + + [v]ā [ba]hirdhā vā prahiṇaṃ [s]. ma .. ○ ///

4 /// d. n. [c]. [y]oga ka[ra] .. [y].ḥ [ev].ṃ + + ///

5 /// matsari śatho [m]. .. [v]ī + + + ///

6) SHT 498/1 (FakSHT Tafel 87 f. [middle]; also found at <http://idp.bbaw.de>, <http://idp.bl.uk>)

11. *recto* (Saṅg Ms 75)

5 /// + + + [h]. sa śā[st]ār. + + [t]k. + ///

6 /// + + + [a]nave[k].[o bha]vati : .. ///

7 /// + + + .[ā]ya [b]. hujanaduḥ ///

12. *verso* (Saṅg Ms 76)

1 /// + + + + t. + samagraiḥ saṃ[m]. ///

2 /// + + + + [la]m ut.. .n.ṃ prahā .. ///

3 /// + + + vr. ś c. ta .. ā .. .[ṣ]. [sm]. ///

4 /// + + .. hī evaṃ .[r]. kṣa pra .. [ś]ī [i] ///

5 /// bhikṣur bhava .. sva ..ṃ[d]ṛṣṭipa + ///

7) SHT 1559 (also found at <http://idp.bbaw.de>, <http://idp.bl.uk>)

13. *recto*

y /// + + .[y]. [t]. [dh]. .. + + + + ///

z /// .. kalahabhaṇḍanavīgra[h]. ///

14. *verso*

1 /// [dh]y. t[m]aṃ vā bah. rdhā vā a[p]. ///

2 /// + .i .ā[n]i[ś]. [s]. + ..[ṃ] + ///

8) PCV F21.5

B side

1 /// .. .[dhā vā] ātmanaḥ [p]ra[h]ā[ṇaṃ⁷] samanū .. ///

7) Read *prahāṇam*.

2 /// [h]āsyate | [eva]ṃrūpaṃ yū[y]. .[ā y]. + + + ///

3 /// [t]īvraś [c]eta[sa ār]. .. + + + + + ///

9) PCV G3.1

recto

1 /// .. ḥ prahīṇaṃ samanupaśyatha tatra + + + + + + + +
+ + ///

2 /// + + + + .. [v]i[v]ādamūlaṃ sace[d]. .[y]. tm. k. vā
bahirdhā [v]ā [ā] .[m]. .. + ///

3 /// + + + + ○ vaṃ vas tad vivādam[ūlaṃ] sa[m]. [nu] ///

2.3. Restitution

(1.4/3.3) ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni ka(5.3)tamāni ṣaṭ* ihaika(1.5)tyaḥ
krodhano bhavaty (upanāhī |) (7.3) yo 'sau krodhano bhav(aty upa)-
(9.3)nā(11.5)hī⁸⁾ sa śāstāraṃ na satkaroti na gurukaroti na (m)ā-
nayati na (3.4) pū(5.4)jayati sa śāstāraṃ asatku(rvaṃ)(1.6)n aguru-
kurvaṃ amā(na)(7.4)ya(ṃ)n apūjayam dh(armaṃ na pa)(13.y)-
(ś)y(a)(9.4)ti dh(armam a)p(a)śyaṃ śrāmaṇye (11.6) anavek(ś)o
bhavati : (yaḥ śr)āmaṇy(e) anave(kṣaḥ) sa saṃghe tadrūpaṃ (ra-
ṇa)(3.5/5.5)m utpādayati (13.z) kalahabhaṇḍana(1.7)vigrahavivā-
daṃ yo bhavati kal(ahabhaṇḍanavigraha)(9.5)(v)i(v)ādaḥ ba(huja-
nānarthāya bahujanāhi)(11.7)(t)āya b(a)hujanaduḥ(khāya) ana(r-
thāyā)hitāya (3.6) duḥkhāya (6.1) devamanuṣyāṇām e(vaṃrūpaṃ yū-

8) Thus Ms 9.3. Ms 11.5 /// [h]; supposedly not the rest of *hī*, but of *hi*.

yaṃ vi) (2.1)vādamūlaṃ s(a)ty ā(14.1)dhyātmaṃ vā bahirdhā vā ap(ra-
hīṇaṃ samanupaśyatha⁹⁾ tatra vaḥ sahi)(12.1)t(ai)(10.1)ḥ (6.2) sam-
agraiḥ¹⁰⁾ saṃmodamānair a(vivada)(3.7)mānais¹¹⁾ tīvraś¹⁰⁾ cchandaś¹²⁾
ca vyāy(āma)(8.2)ś cotsāh(aś) c(o)tsu(ḍhi)(2.2)ś cāprā(14.2)tivāniś
ca (10.2) smṛ(t)yā saṃprajanyena¹³⁾ ca (yogaḥ karaṇīyaḥ¹⁴⁾ evaṃ vas
ta)(6.3)d vivādamū(12.2)lam utpannaṃ¹⁵⁾ prahās(ya)t(e) : ev(amṛ)ū-
paṃ yū(yaṃ) vi(3.8/8.3)vādamūlaṃ saty ādhyātm(aṃ) (10.3) vā bahir-
dhā vā prahiṇaṃ¹⁶⁾ (2.3) samanupaśyatha¹⁷⁾ ta(tra vaḥ sahitaiḥ) (6.4) sam-
agraiḥ saṃmodamānair (av)i(vadamānais tī)(12.3)vr(a)ś c(e)(8.4)-
tasa āraḥṣā smṛtir apramā(10.4)dena ca yogaḥ ka(4.1)raṇīyaḥ¹⁸⁾

9) Or °eta? Cf. note 17), below.

10)–10) Ms 6.2 [s(am)]mo[da]m[ā]nais tivr]. ///

11) Ms 2.1 °mā[naiḥ]s.

12) Ms 2.1 ca[nd]. ///

13) Ms 10.2 °jaṃnyena.

14) SatyaSū § 5 *adhimātraṃ tīvraśchando* (or rather *tīvraś chando*? Ms *adhimātra tīvra* ..)
vyāyāmaś <*cotsāhaś*> *cotsudhiś cāprāti[vā]niś* (ed. °*prativāniś*) *ca smṛtyā saṃprajanyena*
ca yogaḥ karaṇīyaḥ. Cf. Divy 655.2 f. *adhimātraṃ tīvraśchando vīryavyāyāmaḥ* |
utsāhany ūtir aprativāniḥ smṛtyā saṃprajanyenāpramādato (ed. °*janyetāpra*°) *yogaḥ*
karaṇīyaḥ; Śrbh(T) I 150.20 ff. *yaś chando vīryo* (Ms °*am*) *vyāyāmo ... utsāha utsūḍhir*
aprativāniś cetasaḥ saṅgrahaḥ sātatyam.

15) Ms 6.3 °a.

16) Thus Ms 10.3.

17) Thus according to Adhik-v(Skt) fol. 336 verso 4, 10. Cf. also PCV G3.1 recto 1; SC
MS 2627/2 [middle] A6 f. Ms 2.3 *sa[ṇm](a)[n]upaśyata*; Ms 10.3 [s(a)]ma .. //. Or
read *samanupaśyeta*?

18) Cf. EĀ(Trip) §§ 28.5, 29.5; VinKṣu(Bhī) 24 b5 et passim *tīvraś cetasa* (EĀ(Trip) °*aḥ*)
āraḥṣā smṛtyapramāde (ed. *āraḥṣāsmṛty*°) *yogaḥ karaṇīyaḥ*; VinKṣu(Bhī) 25 b5
pūrvavad yāvad smṛtyapramāde yogaḥ karaṇīyaḥ; Śrbh(T) II 154.12 f. *tathā*
copasthitasmṛter apramādaś cetasa āraḥṣā.

evaṃ vas tad vi(vādamūlaṃ samyaksu)(2.4)sa(mava)(6.5)h(i)tam āy(a-
t)y(ā)ṃ (notpats)y(a)t(e) : yathā kro(dhana upanā)(12.4)hī evaṃ (8.5)
mr(a)kṣ(ī)¹⁹⁾ pradāśī²⁰⁾ irṣyuko (10.5)²¹⁾⁻matsarī śaṭho⁻²¹⁾ māyāvī ahrī-
(mān anavatrāpī pāpēccho mithyādr̥ṣṭikaḥ || punar aparam ihaika-
tya)(4.2)ḥ svayaṃdr̥ṣṭiparāmarś(ī bhavati) (2.5) a(sama)ñjasagrāhī duṣ-
pratiniḥsargamaṃtr(ī yo 'sau) (12.5) bhikṣur bhava(ti) sva(ya)ṃdr̥ṣṭi-
parāmarśī asam(a)ṃ(ja)sa(g)r(āhī d)uṣpratini(ḥsargamantrī sa śāstā-
raṃ na satkaroti pū)(2.6)rvavad yāvad āy(a)ty(āṃ) notpatsyate :

3. New Reading of the Corresponding Portion in the Adhikaraṇavastu

Fol. 336 verso

- 1 saḍ vivādamūlāni katamāni | yathāpīhaikaḥ krodhano bhavati |
upanāhī | yo sau krodhano bhavaty upanāhī | śāstāraṃ na
satkaroti | na gurukaroti {na gurukaroti} na mānayati na pūjayati
śāstāraṃ asatkurvaṃn agurukurvaṃn amānayann apūjayaṃ
dharmaṃ na paśyati |
- 2 dharmam apaśyaṃ śrāmaṇye nirapekṣo bhavati | śrāmaṇye
nirapekṣaḥ saṃghe tadrūpaṃ raṇam utpādayati | kalahabhaṇḍa-
navigrahavivādaṃ ya syāt kalahabhaṇḍanavigrahavivāda bahu-
janānarthāya bahujanahitāya bahujanaduḥkhāya anarthāyahitāya

19) Ms 12.4 (m)|r|(a)kṣa.

20) Ms 8.5 °i.

21)-21) Ms 10.5 matsari śaṭho.

duḥkhāya

- 3 devamanuṣyāṇaṃ evaṃrūpa ced yayaṃ bhikṣavo vivādamūlam
adhyātmaṃ bahirdhā vā aprahīnaṃ samanupaśyatha tatra vaḥ
sahitais samagrai saṃmodamānair avivadamānaiḥ tīvracchando
vīryaṃ vyāyama utsāha utsūḍhir aprativāni smṛtyā saṃprajanye
yogaḥ karaṇīyo yā
- 4 vad etasyaiva vivādamūlasyautpannasya prahāṇāya evaṃ ca
tad vivādamūlaṃ prahāsyaty evaṃrūpaṃ saced yūyaṃ bhikṣavo
vivādamūlam adhyātmaṃ vā bardhā vā {a}prahīnaṃ sam-
anupaśyatha tatra vaḥ sahitais samagraiḥ sammodamānair avi-
vadamānais tīvracchando vīryavyāyāmaḥ
- 5 utsāha utsūḍhir aprativāni smṛtyā saṃprajanye yogaḥ karaṇīyo
yāvad e ○ vāsyāiva vivādamūlasya prahīnasyātyatām anavāsra-
vāya evaṃ vas tad vivādamūlaṃ samyaksusamavahitam ātyatām
notpatsyate | yathā krodhana upanāhī mraḥṣaḥ pradāsī ī
- 6 rṣyako matsarī śaṭho māyāvī ahrīmān anapatrāpī pāpeccho
mithyādrṣṭi ○ kaḥ || punar aparam ihaikaḥ svayaṃdrṣṭiparāmarśī
bhavaty asamaṃjasagrāhī duṣpratiniṣargamantrī yo sau
ayaṃdrṣṭiparāmarśī bhavaty asamaṃjasagrāhī | duṣprajñanis-
sargamantrī
- 7 sa śāstāraṃ na saskaroti | na gurukaroti na mānayati na pūjayati
na śā ○ stāraṃ asatkurvaṃn agurukurvaṃn amānayann apūja-
yaṃ{n} dharmāṃ na paśyati dharmam apaśyaṃ śrāmaṇye
nirapekṣo bhavati śrāmaṇye nirapekṣaḥ saḥ saṃghe tadrūpaṃ
raṇam utpādayati kala

- 8 habhaṇḍanavigrahavivādaṃ vaḥ syāt kalahabhaṇḍanavigraha-
vivādo bahujanānarthāya bahujanāhitāya bahujanaduḥkhāya
anarthāyāhitāya devamanuṣyāṇāṃ evaṃrūpaṃ saced yūyaṃ
bhikṣavo vivādamūlaṃ adhyātmaṃ vā bahirdhā vā aprahīṇaṃ
samanu
- 9 paśyatha tatra vaḥ sahitaiḥ samagraiḥ saṃmodamānair aviva-
damānais tīvracchando vīryavyāyama utsāha utsūḍhir aprativāni
smṛtyā saṃprajanye yogaḥ karaṇīyo yāvad evāsyāiva vivāda-
mūlasyotpannasya prahāṇāya evaṃ vas tad vivādamūlaṃ
prahāsyaty evaṃ
- 10 rūpaṃ ced yūya bhikṣavo vivādamūlaṃ adhyātmaṃ vā
bahirdhā vā prahīṇaṃ samanupaśyatha tatra vaḥ sahitaiḥ
samagraiḥ saṃmodamānair avivadamānais tīvracchando vīryaṃ
vyāyāma utsāha utsūḍhir aprativāni smṛtyā śaṃsaprājanye
yogaḥ karaṇīyo yāvad evāsyāiva vivā

Fol. 337 *recto*

- 1 damūlasyāprahāṇasyātyāṃ anavāsraṇāya evaṃ vas tad vivā-
damūlaṃ samyaksusamāhitam āyatyāṃ notpatsyate imāny
ucyante ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni

4. Juxtaposition

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|---|--|--|
| I. | ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni katamāni
ṣaṭ* | 六淨根法者。
云何爲六 | ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni katamāni |
| | <p>T85: ø
 DĀc: 復有六法。謂六淨本
 MĀc: 六淨本者 ...
 AN/MN: cha-y-imāni ... vivādamūlāni. katamāni cha.
 Cv: katamāni cha vivādamūlāni vivādādhikaraṇassa mūlaṃ.
 DN: cha vivādamūlāni.</p> | | |
| II.1.1 | ihaikatyaḥ krodhano bhavaty
(upanāhī) | 答謂有一類有
忿有恨 | yathāpīhaikaḥ krodhano bhava-
ti upanāhī |
| | <p>T85: 阿難。若有苾芻起忿恨心
 DĀc: 若比丘好瞋不捨
 MĀc: 或有一人瞋惱者結纏
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: idha ... bhikkhu kodhano hoti upanāhī.</p> | | |
| II.1.2 | yo 'sau krodhano bhav(aty
upa)nāhi ^{*)} sa śāstāraṃ na satka-
karoti na gurukaroti na (m)ā-
nayatī na pūjayati sa śāstāraṃ
asatku(rvaṃ)n agurukurvaṃn
amā(na)ya(m)n apūjayaṃ
dh(armaṃ na paś)y(a)ti dh(ar-
mam a)p(a)śyaṃ śrāmaṇye
anavek(ś)o bhavati : | 若有忿恨。便
於大師。不能
恭敬供養尊重
讚歎。若於大
師不能恭敬供
養尊重讚歎。
即不見法。若
不見法即不顧
沙門 | yo 'sau krodhano bhavaty upa-
nāhī (sa) śāstāraṃ na satka-
roti na gurukaroti na mānayatī
na pūjayati (sa) śāstāraṃ asat-
kurvaṃn agurukurvaṃn amāna-
yann apūjayaṃ dharmam na
paśyati dharmam apaśyaṃ
śrāmaṇye nirapekṣo bhavati |
| | <p>T85: 由忿恨故。乃於師長不生恭敬尊重等心。亦復不能承事供養。由不恭敬彼
師長故即不見法。以不見法故。於苾芻眾中不正觀察
 DĀc: 不敬如來。亦不敬法。亦不敬眾。於戒穿漏。染汗不淨
 MĀc: 阿難。謂人瞋惱者結纏。彼不敬師。不見法。不護戒
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: yo so ... bhikkhu kodhano hoti upanāhī, so sathari pi agāravo
viharati appaṭṭisso (or appatisso) dhamme pi ... saṅhe pi ... sikkhāya
pi na paripūrakārī hoti.</p> | | |

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|---|--|---|
| II.1.3 | (yaḥ śr)āmany(e) anave(kṣaḥ) sa saṃghe tadrūpaṃ (raṇa)m utpādayati kalahabhaṇḍana-
vighrahavivādaṃ yo bhavati kal(a)habhaṇḍanavighrahav(i)-
(v)ādaḥ ba(hujanānarthāya bahujanāhit)āya b(a)hujana-
duḥ(khāya) ana(rthāyā)hitāya duḥkhāya devamanuṣyāṇāṃ | 若不顧沙門。
便起染著。輕
弄鬪諍。由起
染著。輕弄鬪
諍爲所依止。
令多眾生無義
無利受諸苦
惱。由此鬪諍無
量天人。無義
無利諸苦惱事 | (yaḥ) śrāmaṇye nirapekṣaḥ
(sa) saṃghe tadrūpaṃ raṇam
utpādayati kalahabhaṇḍana-
vighrahavivādaṃ ya(h) syāt kala-
habhaṇḍanavighrahavivādo ²²⁾
bahujanānarthāya bahujanā-
hitāya ²³⁾ bahujanaduḥkhāya
anarthāyāhitāya ²⁴⁾ duḥkhāya
devamanuṣyāṇāṃ |
| | <p>T85: 由不正觀察故乃興鬪諍。由鬪諍起故即令多人乃至諸天人眾。悉無利益咸生苦惱</p> <p>DĀc: 好於眾中多生諍訟。人所憎惡。燒亂淨眾。天人不安</p> <p>MĀc: 彼不敬師。不見法。不護戒已。便於眾中起如是諍。謂此鬪諍不益多人。多人有苦。非義非饒益。非安隱快樂。乃至天人極苦患</p> <p>AN/Cv/DN/MN: yo so ... bhikkhu satthari pi agāro viharati appaṭṭisso (or appaṭṭisso) dhamme ... saṅghe ... sikkhāya na paripūrakārī, so saṅghe (or saṃghe) vivādaṃ janeti, yo (or yo so, or so) hoti vivādo bahujanāhitāya bahujanāsukhāya bahujanassa (or bahuno janassa) anarthāya ahitāya dukkhāya devamanussānaṃ.</p> | | |
| II.1.4 | e(va)mrūpaṃ yūyaṃ vi)vāda-
mūlaṃ s(a)ty ādhyātmaṃ vā
bahirdhā vā ap(rahīnaṃ sam-
anupaśyatha ²⁵⁾ tatra vaḥ sa-
hi)t(ai)ḥ samagraiḥ sammo-
damānair a(vivada)mānais
tīvraś cchandaś ca vyāy(āma)ś
cotsāh(aś) c(o)tsu(dhi)ś cāprā-
tivāniś ca smṛ(t)yā sampra-
janyena ca (yogaḥ karaṇīyaḥ) ²⁵⁾ | 如是諍根汝等
若見。或內或
外有所未斷。
即應聚集和合
精勤。方便求
斷無得放逸。
汝等應使如是
諍根無餘斷滅 | evamrūpa(m sa)ced yūyaṃ ²⁶⁾
bhikṣavo vivādamūlam adhy-
ātmaṃ (vā) bahirdhā vā aprahī-
naṃ samanupaśyatha tatra vaḥ
sahitais samagrai(h) sammo-
damānair avivadamānaih tīvra-
cchando vīryaṃ vyāyāma ²⁷⁾ utsā-
ha utsūḍhir aprativāni smṛtyā
samprajanye yogaḥ karaṇī-
yo ²⁵⁾ yāvad etasyaiva vivāda-
mūlasyotpannasya ²⁸⁾ prahāṇāya |

22) Ms °a.

23) Ms °janahitāya.

24) Ms °rthāyahitāya.

25) Cf. Pāli akusalānaṃ dhammānaṃ pahānāya (or kusalānaṃ dhammānaṃ paṭilabhāya) adhimatto chando ca vāyāmo ca ussāho ca ussoḥhiḥ^oī ca appaṭivāni^oī ca sati ca sampajaññāṇā ca karaṇīyaṃ.

26) Ms yayam.

27) Ms vyāyama.

28) Ms °syautpannasya.

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|---|---------------------------------|--|
| | <p>T85: 又有苾芻。於內於外悉計爲有。作實觀察注意積集。喜爲邪惡極惡作意。勇發邪勤出邪忘語。引起鬪諍</p> <p>DĀc: 諸比丘。汝等當自內觀。設有瞋恨。如彼燒亂者。當集和合眾。廣設方便。拔此諍本</p> <p>MĀc: 阿難。如是鬪諍。汝於內外見而不盡者。爲斷此諍故。汝當速求方便。學極精勤。正念正智。忍莫令退</p> <p>AN/Cv/DN/MN: <i>evārūpaṃ (or °ṃ) ce tumhe ... vivādamūlaṃ ajjhataṃ vā bahiddhā vā samanupasseyyātha tatra tumhe ... tass' eva pāpakassa vivādamūlassa pahānāya vāyameyyātha.</i></p> | | |
| II.1.5 | ∅ | ∅ | ∅ |
| | <p>T85/DĀc: ∅</p> <p>MĀc: 阿難。猶人爲火燒頭。燒衣。急求方便。救頭。救衣²⁹⁾</p> <p>AN/Cv/DN/MN: ∅²⁹⁾</p> | | |
| II.1.6 | (evaṃ vas ta)d vivādamūlam utpannam prahās(ya)t(e) : | 如先未起如是諍根 | evaṃ vas ³⁰⁾ tad vivādamūlam prahāsyaty ³¹⁾ |
| | <p>T85: 如是妄念不正知起不相應。乃至於鬪諍緣不能斷滅</p> <p>DĀc: ∅</p> <p>MĀc: 如是鬪諍。汝於內外見而不盡者。爲斷此諍故。汝當速求方便。學極精勤。正念正智。忍莫令退</p> <p>AN/Cv/DN/MN: <i>see II.1.9, below</i></p> | | |
| II.1.7 | ³²⁾ ev(am)ūpaṃ yū(yaṃ) vivādamūlam saty ādhyāt-m(am) vā bahirdhā vā prahī-ṇaṃ ¹⁶⁾ samanupaśyatha ^{17)/³²⁾} ta(tra vaḥ sahitaiḥ) samagraiḥ saṃmodamānair (av)i(vadamā-nais ti)vr(a)ś c(e)tasa āraḥṣā smṛtir apramādena ca yogaḥ karaṇīyaḥ ¹⁸⁾ | 汝等若見。或內或外皆悉已斷。即應發起正念正知。猛利之心精勤防護 | ³²⁾ evaṃrūpaṃ saced yūyaṃ bhikṣavo vivādamūlam adhy-ātmaṃ vā ba(hi)rdhā vā pra-hīnaṃ ³³⁾ samanupaśyatha ³²⁾ tatra vaḥ sahitais samagraiḥ sammo-damānair avivadamānais ³⁴⁾ tīvracchando vīryavyāyamaḥ utsāha utsūdhir aprativāni smṛtyā samprajanye yogaḥ karaṇīyo ³⁴⁾ yāvad evāsyai va vivādamūlassa prahīṇasyā-tyāṃ anavāsraṇāya |

29) Cf. Pāli *seyyathā pi āvuso ādittacelo vā ādittasīso vā tass' eva celassa vā sīsassa vā nibbāpanāya adhimattaṃ chandaṃ ca vāyāmaṃ ca ... kareyya*; BHSD s.v. *ādīpta-śiraścaīlopama*.

30) Ms ca.

31) PCV F21.5 B1 /// [h]āsyate |.

32)–32) PCV G3.1 recto 2 /// .. [v]i[v]ādamūlaṃ sace[d] (adh)[y](ā)tm(a)k(am) vā ba-hirdhā [v]ā [ā](t)[m](anaḥ prahīṇaṃ samanupaśyatha).

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|---|---|--|
| | <p>T85: ø
 DĀc: 汝等又當專念白觀。若結恨已滅。當更方便。遮止其心。勿復使起
 MĀc: 阿難。如是鬪諍。汝於內外見盡者。汝當重護彼心。常無放逸。欲止此諍故。如是此諍。汝斷根本
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: evarūpaṅ ce tumhe ... vivādamūlaṃ ajjhataṃ vā bahiddhā vā na samanupasseyyātha tatra tumhe ... tass' eva pāpakassa vivādamūlassa āyatim anavassavāya paṭipajjeyyātha.</p> | | |
| II.1.8 | ø | ø | ø |
| | <p>T85/DĀc ø
 MĀc 阿難。猶人爲火燒頭・燒衣。急求方便。救頭・救衣²⁹⁾
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: ø²⁹⁾</p> | | |
| II.1.9 | <p>evaṃ vas tad vi(vādamūlaṃ samyaksu)sa(mava)h(i)tam āy(at)y(ā)ṃ (notpats)y(a)t(e) :</p> | <p>令當來世永不復起。是爲正斷善斷諍根</p> | <p>evaṃ vas tad vivādamūlaṃ samyaksusamavahitam āyatyāṃ notpatsyate </p> |
| | <p>T85: 阿難。如是等事爲鬪諍根本。是故生諸苦惱。苦惱因者。謂由先起忿恨心故
 DĀc: ø
 MĀc: 如是鬪諍。汝於內外見盡者。汝當重護彼心。常無放逸。欲止此諍故。如是此諍。汝斷根本
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: evam etassa pāpakassa vivādamūlassa pahānaṃ hoti. evam etassa pāpakassa vivādamūlassa āyatim anavassavo hoti.</p> | | |
| II.2-5 | <p>yathā kro(dhana upanā)hī evaṃ mr(a)kṣ(ī) pradāśī ir-ṣyuko matsarī ṣaṭho māyāvī ahrī(mān anavatrāpī pāpeccho mithyādṛṣṭikah)</p> | <p>如有忿恨。若有覆惱。若有嫉慳。若有誑諂。〈若無慚愧。若有惡欲〉。若有邪見倒見廣說亦爾</p> | <p>yathā krodhana upanāhī (e-vaṃ) mraṁkṣī³⁵⁾ pradāśī irṣyako matsarī ṣaṭho māyāvī ahrīmān anapatrāpī pāpeccho mithyādṛṣṭikah ³⁶⁾</p> |

33) PCV F21.5 B1 adds *ātmanaḥ before prahīnaṃ*. Cf. also PCV G3.1 recto 1 /// (*ātmana*?)*ḥ prahīnaṃ*.

34)–34) PCV F21.5 B3 /// [t]ivras [c]eta[sa ār]. ... ///. For the Pāli phrase cf. note 25).

35) Ms °*aḥ*.

36) Cf. Dhsk 3 recto 3 *ahrīmān bhikṣavo bhikṣur anapatrāpī mithyādṛṣṭiko bhavati*.

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|--|--|---|
| | <p>T85: 如是復起覆誑諂·嫉慳·無慚無愧·不正知見取等。及諸執著邪妄憶念
 DĀc: 諸比丘。俱戾不諦·慳恚嫉妬·巧偽虛妄·自因已見·謬受不捨·迷於邪見·與邊見俱·亦復如是
 MĀc: 如是不語結·慳嫉·諂誑·無慚無愧·惡欲邪見惡性不可制
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: puna ca paraṃ ... bhikkhu makkhī hoti paḷāsī ..., issukī hoti maccharī ..., saṭho hoti māyāvī ..., pāpiccho hoti micchādīṭṭhī (also °i), sandiṭṭhiparāmāsī hoti ādhānagāhī duppaṭinissaggī (also °i).</p> | | |
| II.6.1 | (punar aparaṃ ihaikatya)h svayaṃdr̥ṣṭiparāmarśī bhavati) a(sama)ñjasagrāhī duṣpratinīḥsargamaṃtrī | 復有一類取著自見。起堅固執難教棄捨 | punar aparaṃ ihaikaḥ svayaṃdr̥ṣṭiparāmarśī bhavaty asamamñjasagrāhī duṣpratinnissargamantrī |
| | <p>T85: ø; DĀc: abr.
 MĀc: 阿難。若有一人惡欲邪見惡性不可制
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: ø</p> | | |
| II.6.2 | (yo 'sau) bhikṣur bhava(ti) sva(ya)ṃdr̥ṣṭiparāmarśī asam(a)m(ja)sa(g)r(āhī d)uṣpratinī(ḥsargamantrī sa śāstāraṃ na satkaroti pū)rvavad yāvad ā(ya)(t)ṃ notpat-syate : | 若取著自見起堅固執難教棄捨。便於大師不能恭敬供養尊重讚歎。若於大師不能恭敬供養尊重讚歎。即不見法。若不見法即不顧沙門 | yo 'sau svayaṃdr̥ṣṭiparāmarśī ³⁷⁾ bhavaty asamamñjasagrāhī duṣprajñānissargamantrī sa śāstāraṃ na satkaroti ³⁸⁾ na gurukaroti na mānayati na pūjayati sa ³⁹⁾ śāstāraṃ asatkurvaṃṇ agurukurvaṃṇ amānayaṃ apūjayaṃ dharmam na paśyati dharmam apaśyaṃ śrāmaṇye nirapekṣo bhavati |
| | <p>T85: 以如是等諸惡因緣故。乃於師長不生恭敬尊重等心。亦復不能承事供養。由不尊敬彼師長故即不見法。以不見法故。即於苾芻眾中不正觀察
 DĀc: abr.
 MĀc: 彼不敬師。不見法。不護戒
 AN/Cv/DN/MN: yo so ... bhikkhu sandiṭṭhiparāmāsī hoti ādhānagāhī duppaṭinissaggī (also °i), so sathari pi agāraṃ viharati appaṭisso (or appaṭisso) dhamme pi ... saṅhe pi ... sikkhāya pi na paripūrakārī hoti.</p> | | |

37) Ms *ayamdr̥ṣṭi*°.38) Ms *sask*°.39) Ms *na*.

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|--|---|---|
| II.6.3 | <i>abr.; see II.1.3, above</i> | 若不顧沙門。
便起染著輕弄
鬪諍。由起染
著輕弄鬪諍為
所依止。令多
眾生無義無利
受諸苦惱。由
此能引無量天
人無義無利諸
苦惱事 | (yaḥ) śrāmaṇye nirapekṣaḥ
saḥ saṃghe tadrūpaṃ raṇam
utpādayati kalahabhaṇḍana-
vighrahavivādaṃ yaḥ syāt kala-
habhaṇḍanavighrahavivādo
bahujanānarthāya bahunānā-
hitāya bahunaduḥkhāya
anarthāyāhitāya (duḥkhāya)
devamanuṣyāṇaṃ |
| | T85: 由不正觀察故乃興鬪諍
DĀc: <i>abr.</i>
MĀc: 彼不敬師。不見法。不護戒已。便於眾中起如是諍。謂此鬪諍不益多人。
多人有苦。非義非饒益。非安隱快樂。乃至天人生極苦患
AN/Cv/DN/MN: yo so ... bhikkhu satthari pi agāro viharati appaṭṭiso
(or appaṭṭiso) dhamme ... saṃghe ... sikkhāya na pariṭṭakārī so saṅ-
ghe vivādaṃ janeti, yo (or yo so, or so) hoti vivādo bahunānāhitāya
bahujanāsukhāya bahunassa (or bahuno janassa) anarthāya ahitāya
dukkhāya devamanussānaṃ. | | |
| II.6.4 | <i>abr.; see II.1.4, above</i> | 如是諍根汝等
若見或內或外。
有所未斷。即
應聚集和合精
勤。方便求斷
無得放逸。汝
等應使如是諍
根無餘斷滅 | evaṃrūpaṃ saced yūyaṃ
bhikṣavo vivādamūlam
adhyātmaṃ vā bahirdhā vā
aprahīṇaṃ samanupaśyatha
tatra vaḥ sahitaiḥ samagraiḥ
saṃmodamānair avivadamā-
nais tīvracchando vīryavyā-
yāma ⁴⁰⁾ utsāha utsūḍhir
aprativāni smṛtyā sampra-
janye yogaḥ karaṇīyo ²⁵⁾ yā-
vad evāyaiva vivādamūla-
syotpannasya prahāṇāya |
| | T85: ø; DĀc: <i>abr.</i>
MĀc: 阿難。如是鬪諍。汝於內外見而不盡者。為斷此諍故。汝當速求方便。
學極精勤。正念正智。忍莫令退
AN/Cv/DN/MN: evarūpaṃ ce tumhe ... vivādamūlam ajjhataṃ vā bahiddhā
vā samanupasseyyātha tatra tumhe ... tass' eva pāpakassa vivādamū-
lassa pahāṇāya vāyameyyātha. | | |

40) Ms °vyāyama.

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|---|--|---|
| II.6.5 | ∅ | ∅ | ∅ |
| | T85/DĀc: ∅
MĀc: 阿難。猶人爲火燒頭・燒衣。急求方便。救頭・救衣 ²⁹⁾
AN/Cv/DN/MN: ∅ ²⁹⁾ | | |
| II.6.6 | <i>abr.; see II.1.6, above</i> | 如先未起如是
諍根 | evaṃ vas tad vivādamūlaṃ
prahāsyaty |
| | T85: ∅; DĀc: ∅
MĀc: 如是鬪諍。汝於內外見而不盡者。爲斷此諍故。汝當速求方便。學極精勤。正念正智。忍莫令退
AN/Cv/DN/MN: <i>see II.6.9, below</i> | | |
| II.6.7 | <i>abr.; see II.1.7, above</i> | 汝等若見或內
或外皆悉已
斷。即應發起
正念正知猛利
之心。精勤防
護 | evaṃrūpaṃ <sa>ced yūya(m)
bhikṣavo vivādamūlamm
adhyātmaṃ vā bahirdhā vā
prahīṇaṃ samanupaśyatha
tatra vaḥ sahaitiḥ samagraiḥ
saṃmodamānair avivadamānais
⁴¹⁾ tīvracchando vīryaṃ vyāyā-
ma utsāha utsūḍhir aprativāni
smṛtyā samprajanye ⁴²⁾ yogaḥ
karaṇīyo ⁴¹⁾ yāvad evāsyaiḥ
vivādamūlasya prahīṇsyāya-
tyām ⁴³⁾ anavāsravāya |
| | T85: ∅; DĀc: <i>abr.</i>
MĀc: 阿難。如是鬪諍。汝於內外見盡者。汝當重護彼心。常無放逸。欲止此諍故。如是此諍。汝斷根本
AN/Cv/DN/MN: evarūpaṃ ce tumhe ... vivādamūlaṃ ajjhattaṃ vā bahiddhā
vā na samanupasseyyātha tatra tumhe ... tass' eva pāpakassa vivāda-
mūlassa āyatīṃ anavassavāya patipajjeyyātha. | | |
| II.6.8 | ∅ | ∅ | ∅ |
| | T85/DĀc: ∅
MĀc: 阿難。猶人爲火燒頭・燒衣。急求方便。救頭・救衣 ²⁹⁾
AN/Cv/DN/MN: ∅ ²⁹⁾ | | |

41)–41) Cf. note 34).

42) Ms *sāmsapra*°.43) Ms *vivādamūlasyprahāṇasyāyatīyām*.

| | Saṅg | SaṅgPar | Adhik-v(Skt) |
|--------|---|-------------------|--|
| II.6.9 | <i>abr.; see II.1.9, above</i> | 令當來世永不復起。是爲正斷善斷諍根 | evam vas tad vivādamūlaṃ samyaksusamāhitam āyatyāṃ notpatsyate |
| | T85: 阿難。如我所說。如是等緣皆是鬪諍根本
DĀc: ø
MĀc: 如是鬪諍。汝於內外見盡者。汝當重護彼心。常無放逸。欲止此諍故。如是此諍。汝斷根本
AN/Cv/DN/MN: evam etassa pāpakassa vivādamūlassa pahānaṃ hoti.
evam etassa pāpakassa vivādamūlassa āyatīṃ anavassavo hoti. | | |
| III. | ø | ø | imāny ucyante ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni |
| | T85/DĀc/MĀc/DN: ø
AN/MN: imāni ... cha vivādamūlāni.
Cv: imāni cha vivādamūlāni vivādādhikaraṇassa mūlaṃ. | | |

약호 및 참고문헌

Abbreviations

- Adhik-v(Skt) = *The Gilgit Manuscript of the Śāyanāsanavastu and the Adhikaraṇavastu, Being the 15th and 16th Sections of the Vinaya of the Mūlasarvāstivādin*, ed. R. Gnoli, Roma, 1978 (SOR 50), pp. 57-110.
- Adhik-v(Tib) = *rTsod pa'i* (or *rTsod pa źi bar byed pa'i*) *gźi* (A Tibetan Translation of the Adhikaraṇavastu of the Mūlasarvāstivāda Tradition by Sarvajñādeva et al.), D no. 1, vol. 1, pp. 244 (443.5)-253 (510.1); Q no. 1030, vol. 42, pp. 1 (1.2)-12 (3.4).
- AN = *Aṅguttara-Nikāya*, ed. R. Morris, E. Hardy, 5 vols., London, 1885-1900 (PTS); vol. 6 (Indexes, by M. Hunt, C. A. F. Rhys Davids) London, 1910 (PTS).
- Avś = *Avadānaśataka*, ed. J. S. Speyer, St. Petersburg, 1906-1909 (Bibliotheca Buddhica 3).
- Bureau, Recherches = A. Bureau, *Recherches sur la biographie du Bouddha dans les Sūtrapiṭaka et les Vinayapiṭaka anciens*, 3 vols., Paris, 1963, 1970 f., 1995 (Publications de l'École Française d'Extrême-Orient 53, 77, 178).
- BHSD = F. Edgerton, *Buddhist Hybrid Sanskrit Grammar and Dictionary*, vol. 2: Dictionary, New Haven, 1953.
- BKD = *Bussho kaisetsu daijiten* (A Bibliographical Lexicon of Buddhist Works written in Chinese or Japanese), 12 vols., ed. G. Ono, Tōkyō, 1933-1936.
- BLSF = *Buddhist Manuscripts from Central Asia: The British Library*

- Sanskrit Fragments*, ed. S. Karashima, K. Wille, Tōkyō, 2006-.
- Cv = “Cullavagga”, in: *Vinayapiṭaka*, ed. H. Oldenberg, 5 vols., London, 1879-1883 (PTS), vol. II.
- D = *The Tibetan Tripiṭaka*, Taipei Edition (= sDe-dge), ed. A. W. Barber, 72 vols., Taipei, 1991.
- DĀc = *Chang-ahanjing/-ehanjing* (Jpn. *Jō-agongyō/-kyō*; a Chinese Translation of the Dīrghāgama by Buddhayaśas & Zhu Fonian), T 1, vol. 1, pp. 1-149.
- DhCakrP-dh = J. Chung, “Dharmacakrapravartana-dharmaparyāya of the Sarvāstivāda and Mūlasarvāstivāda tradition”, *Jaina-itihāsa-ratna, Festschrift für Gustav Roth zum 90. Geburtstag*, ed. U. Hüsken et al., Marburg, 2006 (IndTib 47), pp. 75-101.
- Divy = *Divyāvadāna*, ed. E. B. Cowell, R. A. Neil, Cambridge, 1879.
- DN = *Dīghanikāya*, ed. T. W. Rhys Davids, J. E. Carpenter, 3 vols., London, 1890-1911 (PTS).
- DZD = *Daizōkyō zen kaisetsu daijiten* (A Bibliographical Lexicon of the Buddhist Works contained in the Taishō edition of the Chinese Tripiṭaka), ed. Sh. Kamata et al., Tōkyō, 1998.
- EĀ(Trip) = *Ekottarāgama-Fragmente der Gilgit-Handschrift*, hrsg. und bearbeitet von Ch. Tripāṭhī, Reinbek, 1995 (Studien zur Indologie und Iranistik, Monographie 2).
- EĀc = *Zengyi-ahanjing/-ehanjing* (Jpn. *Zōichi-agongyō/-kyō*; a Chinese Translation of the Ekottarikāgama [supposedly] by Saṃghadeva), T 125, vol. 2, pp. 549-830. [cf. BKD VII, pp. 57-60; DZD, pp. 31 f.]
- FakSHT = *Faksimile-Wiedergaben von Sanskrithandschriften aus den Berliner Turfanfunden I: Handschriften zu fünf Sūtras des Dīrghā-*

gama, ed. E. Waldschmidt et al., The Hague, 1963 (Indo-Iranian Facsimiles Series 1).

IndTib = Indica et Tibetica, Bonn et al.

MĀc = *Zhong-ahanjing/-ehanjing* (Jpn. *Chū-agongyō/-kyō*; a Chinese Translation of the Madhyamāgama [supposedly] by Saṃghadeva), T 26, vol. 1, pp. 421-809.

MN = *Majjhima-Nikāya*, ed. V. Trenckner, R. Chalmers, 3 vols., London, 1888-1899 (PTS).

MN(Ñ) = *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha: A Translation of the Majjhima Nikāya*, translated by Bhikkhu Ñāṇamoli, revised by Bhikkhu Bodhi, Boston, 2009.

MPS = E. Waldschmidt, *Das Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra, Text in Sanskrit und Tibetisch, verglichen mit dem Pāli nebst einer Übersetzung der chinesischen Entsprechung im Vinaya der Mūlasarvāstivādins, auf Grund von Turfan-Handschriften hrsg. und bearbeitet*, Teil I-III, Berlin, 1950-1951 (Abhandlungen der Deutschen Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Berlin 1/1949, 2 f./1950).

Or. = Oriental (manuscript accession sequence of the British Library, London).

PCV = “Private Collection, Virginia” (USA).

PTS = Pali Text Society, London/Oxford.

Q = *The Tibetan Tripiṭaka*, Peking Edition, ed. D. T. Suzuki, 168 vols., Tōkyō/Kyōto, 1955-1961.

SĀc = *Za-ahanjing/-ehanjing* (Jpn. *Zō-agongyō/-kyō*; a Chinese Translation of the Saṃyuktāgama by Guṇabhadra), T 99, vol. 2, pp. 1-373. [cf. BKD VII, pp. 61 f.; DZD, pp. 25 f.]

Samṅhabh = *The Gilgit Manuscript of the Saṅghabhedavastu, Being the 17th and last Section of the Vinaya of the Mūlasarvāstivādin*, ed. R. Gnoli, 2 parts, Roma, 1977, 1978 (SOR 49.1, 2).

Saṅg = *Das Saṅgītisūtra und sein Kommentar Saṅgītiparyāya (Dogmatische Begriffsreihen im älteren Buddhismus II)*, ed. V. Stache-Rosen (nach Vorarbeiten von K. Mittal), Berlin, 1968 (Sanskrittexte aus den Turfanfunden 9).

SaṅgPar = *Apidamo jiyimen zulun (A Chinese Translation of the Saṅgītiparyāya by Xuanzang)*, T 1536, vol. 26, pp. 367-453.

SatyaSū = E. Waldschmidt, “Satyasūtra”, in: “Kleine Brāhmī-Schriftrolle”, *Nachrichten der Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen, Phil.-Hist. Kl.*, 1/1959, pp. 18 f., 24 f. [repr.: idem, *Von Ceylon bis Turfan, Schriften zur Geschichte, Literatur, Religion und Kunst des indischen Kulturraumes (Festgabe zum 70. Geburtstag)*, Göttingen, 1967, pp. 388 f., 394 f.].

Śay = *The Gilgit Manuscript of the Śayanāsanavastu and the Adhikaraṇavastu, Being the 15th and 16th Sections of the Vinaya of the Mūlasarvāstivādin*, ed. R. Gnoli, Roma, 1978 (SOR 50), pp. 1-56.

SC = Schøyen Collection, Oslo.

ShLü = *Shisong-lü*, T no. 1435, vol. 23, 1-470 (61 scrolls); translated in 404-409 A.D. by Furuoduoluo 弗若多羅 (Puṇyatrāta/Puṇyatara) et al.

SHT = *Sanskrithandschriften aus den Turfanfunden*, ed. (in chief) E. Waldschmidt, H. Bechert, Teil I-III, E. Waldschmidt et al., Wiesbaden, 1965, 1968, 1971 (VOHD X,1-3); Teil IV-V, L. Sander, E. Waldschmidt, Wiesbaden/Stuttgart, 1980, 1985 (VOHD X,4 f.); Teil VI-XI, K. Wille, Stuttgart, 1989, 1995, 2000, 2004, 2008,

2012 (VOHD X,6-11).

SOR = Serie Orientale Roma, Roma.

ŚrBh(T) = Śrāvabhūmi Study Group, *Yugaron Shōmonji: Sansukurittogo tekisuto to wayaku (Śrāvabhūmi: Revised Sanskrit Text and Japanese Translation)*, 2 parts, Tōkyō, 1998, 2007 (Taishō Daigaku Sōgō Bukkyō Kenkyūjo Kenkyū Sōsho [Buddhist Studies Series of the Institute for Comprehensive Studies of Buddhism of the Taishō University] 4, 18).

SWTF = *Sanskrit-Wörterbuch der buddhistischen Texte aus den Turfan-Funden*, ed. H. Bechert et al., Göttingen, 1973 ff.

Survey(SĀ) = J. Chung, *A Survey of the Sanskrit Fragments Corresponding to the Chinese Saṃyuktāgama*, Tōkyō, 2008.

T = *Taishō shinshū daizōkyō* or *Taishō issaikyō*, 100 vols., Tōkyō, 1924 ff.

ÜLB = E. Waldschmidt, *Die Überlieferung vom Lebensende des Buddha, eine vergleichende Analyse des Mahāparinirvāṇasūtra und seiner Textentsprechungen*, 2 Teile, Göttingen, 1944, 1948 (Abhandlungen der Akademie der Wissenschaften zu Göttingen, Phil.-Hist. Kl., 3. Folge, 29, 30).

VinKṣu(Bhī) = M. Schmidt, “Bhikṣuṇī-Karmavācānā: Die Handschrift Sansk. c.25(R) der Bodleian Library Oxford”, *Studien zur Indologie und Buddhismuskunde, Festgabe des Seminars für Indologie und Buddhismuskunde für Professor Dr. Heinz Bechert*, ed. R. Grünendahl et al., Bonn, 1993 (IndTib 22), pp. 239-288.

VOHD = Verzeichnis der orientalischen Handschriften in Deutschland, Wiesbaden/Stuttgart.

VUG = 'Dul ba g'zui dam pa (*Vinaya-uttaragrantha*), D no. 7, vol. 2, pp. 305 (184.1)-455 (625.5); Q no. 1037, vol. 45, pp. 37 (1.3)-236 (4.8).

Symbols Used

| | |
|----------|---------------------------------------|
| [] | damaged akṣara |
| () | restored akṣara |
| < > | omitted akṣara |
| { } | superfluous akṣara |
| .. | illegible akṣara |
| . | single element of an illegible akṣara |
| + | lost akṣara |
| /// | leaf broken off here |
| / | the end of a line |
| ' | avagraha, not written in manuscripts |
| * | virāma |
| · | punctuation mark/visarga |
| : | |
| | punctuation mark |
| | |
| <u>h</u> | jihvāmūliya |
| ○ | punch hole |
| ∅ | unknown/not extant |

Abstract

**Vinaya Elements in Āgama Texts
as a Criterion of the School Affiliation
— Taking the Six *vivādamūlas* as an Example —**

Jin-il Chung

Sanskrit-Wörterbuch, Göttingen Academy of Sciences and Humanities, Germany

The Āgama texts from Eastern Turkestan and those contained in the so-called Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya from Gilgit are, apart from differences in diction, by and large congruent, whereas the Vinaya texts differ from each other considerably. This circumstance has led scholars to assume that the two Buddhist schools possessed their own Vinaya traditions, but shared an Āgama tradition. The congruency between the Āgama texts from Eastern Turkestan and the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya, however, does not seem to have been confined to the Āgama citations, or to the narrative portions. In the Saṅgīti-sūtra reconstructed on the basis of Sanskrit fragments from Eastern Turkestan there are passages on the six roots of contention (Skt. *ṣaḍ vivādamūlāni*). These passages

show a striking similarity to the corresponding portion in the Adhikaraṇavastu from Gilgit, a degree of similarity which cannot be observed between the Shisong-lü and the Mūlasarvāstivāda Vinaya. From this point of view, it is tempting to assume that the Buddhists who passed down the Āgama tradition found in Eastern Turkestan possessed a Vinaya corpus which rather looked like the Vinaya from Gilgit than the Shisong-lü. Seeing that the existence of both Vinaya traditions has been proven in Eastern Turkestan, a reconsideration of the relationship between the Āgama texts from Eastern Turkestan and the so-called Sarvāstivāda Vinaya tradition including the Shisong-lü, appears to be indispensable.

Key Words: six vivādamūla, Sarvāstivādin, Mūlasarvāstivādin, Vinaya, Āgama, Eastern Turkestan, Gilgit

2013년 11월 20일 투고

2013년 12월 13일 심사완료

2013년 12월 20일 게재확정