

Christian and Confucian Concepts of Vocation

Lee, Sang Hoon (Presbyterian College and Theological
Seminary Visiting Lecturer / Ethics)

I. I. Introduction

II. The Christian Understanding of Vocation

- A. The Independent Social Sectors: Spheres
- B. Vocation in the New Testament and the Development of the Monastic Ideal
- C. Vocation in the Reformed Tradition

III. Confucian Understanding of Vocation

IV. Christian Contribution to the Confucian Concept of Vocation

V. Conclusion

• 국문초록 •

일반적으로 기독교 신학적 개념으로 이해되어지는 ‘소명’이 유교 사상에서도 발견되는가? 본 논문은 이 질문에 대해 그 가능성을 조심스럽게 논의해 보고자 하는 시도이다. 본 논문은 우선 소명에 관한 기독교 신학적 이해에 대해 살펴보았다. 여기서 소명을 개인적이고 사적인 차원과 공적 혹은 공동체적인 차원이 있음을 밝히고 전자를 “영역 주권론”과 관련하여 취급하였고 이어서 개인적이고 사적인 차원의 소명개념을 설명하였다. 개인적인 소명이해는 중세기를 거치면서 회람적 유대문화와 로마제국의 정치질서의 영향으로 성사(聖事)와 명상중심의 영적인 삶과 성직에 치중하는 경향을 보였다. 그러나 종교개혁자들은 이러한 경향과 위축된 소명이해를 되돌려 신자 개인의 신앙을 강조하고 진정한 소명은 세속 세계의 일상적인 삶과 유리되지 않음을 강조하였다.

그럼 유교사상에서 기독교적 소명개념과 비교될 수 있는 사상은 무엇인가? 필자는 유교의 경세(經世)사상이 기독교의 소명개념과 유사하며 이 사상에서 유교적 소명의 가능성이 있음을 논의해 보았다. 그러나 기독교적 소명개념과 달리 유교의 경세사상은 우주와 사회의 조화를 강조하는 “천인(天人)합일” 사상의 영향으로 자아(自我)의 내면세계를 수련하려는 끊임없는 충동 혹은 동인(動因)이 외부 세계 (자연 세계와 인간 사회)와 관련해서는 발견되지 않음을 지적하였다. 또한 유교적 도(道)에서 노정되는 초월성의 약화는 정치적 보수화와 개혁과 변혁의 요소의 결여를 초래하였고 도덕적 엘리트 중심의 경세사상은 정치 영역으로 축소되는 경향을 보임으로 그 본래적 풍부성이 위축되고 광범위한 사회분야로의 적용 가능성을 차단하였다. 이에 본 논문은 기독교 신학적 소명 개념의 초월성과 타락으로 인한 인간과 자연세계와 인간사회의 변혁의 필요성에 대한 이해가 유교적 소명이해의 폭을 넓히고 그 보편적 적용 가능성을 제고 할수 있음을 주장하였다.

Keywords: 유교, 기독교, 소명, 경세(經世), 영역주권

Confucianism, Christianity, Vocation, Ching-Shih, Sphere
Sovereignty

I. Introduction

This paper will discuss the Christian concept of vocation and examine the plausibility of its Confucian development, which is yet held in check by the constricting elements of the Confucian heritage. In doing so it is hoped that the Christian concept of vocation can challenge the constrained and ideologized Confucian version and help to revitalize the latter as a theoretical framework for a desirable ethos in Korean-Confucian society. Shirley Roels suggests that vocation, traditionally recognized as a Christian ethical theme, is also relevant to non-Christians and their cultures and societies.¹⁾ No clear reason may be proposed for denying the possible presence of their rough counterparts within other religious-cultural backgrounds. Then the issue revolves around the question to what extent the Confucian development of vocation can be compared to the Christian version. In this paper I will argue that some aspects of Confucian values inherently have a similarity with Christian ethical notion of vocation. The implication is that key elements of Confucian ethics, stripped of their patriarchal distortions, can contribute to enriching the moral and ethical life of Korean-Confucian society. To this end it is important to recapture the deep-seated but implicitly manifested concepts such as *ching-shih* (經世) in the Confucian liberal tradition.

1) Shirley J. Roels, "Organization Man, Organization Woman: Faith, Gender, and Management," in *Organization Man, Organization Woman: Calling, Leadership, and Culture*, Shirley J. Roels et al. (Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1997).

II. The Christian Understanding of Vocation

The doctrine of vocation is predicated on the biblical conviction that at creation, "humans are given a stewardly dominion over the creatures and a vocation to create culture from the beginning of existence."²⁾ The concept of vocation generally refers to the idea that God calls human beings as God's creation to a particular mundane task or duty as a sphere and means of faithfully carrying out religious obedience. That is, God created human beings in this world with a specific purpose and, in this sense, all of us have a divine vocation to care for and engage in the entire creation in the economy of God. This concept of vocation is, therefore, closely associated with the theological idea that we humans are created in the image of God with a capacity for self-transcendence, a dignity, abilities and a God-given purpose. Embedded in this idea is the conviction that human life is bound to serve God in an effort to live out the divine intentions at the creation of humanity, as is shown in the etymological meaning of "vocation," a "calling" designed to "evoke specific responses" of obedience.³⁾

One may find that the idea of vocation is prone to personal and individual application. However, the Christian concept of vocation does not bear only on the personal or private dimension of human life but it also carries intrinsic relevance to its public or communal dimension,

2) Max L. Stackhouse, "Vocation," in *The Oxford Handbook of Theological Ethics*, forthcoming, 1.

3) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 1.

i.e., direct implications for a multiplicity of public institutions. The public aspect significantly reveals that vocation intrinsically unfolds itself to demonstrate and affirm "pluralism in society." The societal level of pluralism means that human society and life essentially depend on multiple "spheres," "arenas," or "orders" of life for its desirable viability. In the same pattern shown in the personal dimension of vocation, the public dimension of vocation emphasizes the unique character and nature of each sphere and the interdependence of the different spheres. Therefore, this public aspect avoids the confluence and confusion of different functions and purposes among various spheres, promotes distinctive values suitable to, and defining characteristics intrinsic to, each sphere, and thus rejects the domination of one sphere over the other(s). In other words, all spheres or sectors are divinely called to, and so must perform, "certain functions of and for human society with excellence and clarity of purpose, or they are subject to either critique and transformation or destruction."⁴ The individual or communal expressions of human depravity can be maximally curbed by "rightly ordered," an "ascetic" life concerned with glorifying God and serving others.⁵ Bearing this in mind, let us first turn to the independent social sectors or spheres.

4) Roels, "Organization Man, Organization Woman," 25. If some spheres are not developed in society, the vocation is frustrated.

5) Max L. Stackhouse, "Religion, Society and the Independent Sector: Key Elements of a General Theory," in *Religion, the Independent Sector, and American Culture*, ed. Conrad Cherry and Rowland A. Sherrill (Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars Press, 1992), 16.

A. The Independent Social Sectors: Spheres

Human societies are often regarded as a complex of interacting systems of sectors, each of which is autonomous and distinct in nature and character, but mutually influential on each other. Such terms as "sectors," "spheres," "arenas," "departments of life," and "orders" of life argue for pluralism and multiplicity as explicit tendencies of modern society. This modern social development, with its roots in classical theory, bears within it a social ethical conviction that every human community consists of certain ordering systems, i.e., family, economics, politics, culture, and religion, which can be variously related. Each of these systems or sectors, as necessary components of and for human existence, not only frequently intersect with, but also reinforce and influence one another, with one system functioning to sustain another. All sectors have their own distinctive institutions, which pattern and organize human life according to their characters and thus are requisite to both individual and collective existence. It is in this sense that to maintain common life requires "symbiotic associations" in a genuine commonwealth with anarchy and tyranny arrested.⁶⁾

In order to extend our discussion on this theme, let us take up Abraham Kuyper's understanding of Calvinism. In fact, much socially concerned Calvinist thought is substantially connected with the covenants of civility, and Calvinism played a significant role in developing the pluralism of modernity.⁷⁾ According to Kuyper, Calvinism holds

6) "Symbiotic associations" is Johannes Althusius'phrase. See his *The Politics of Johannes Althusius*, trans., with an introduction by Frederick S. Carney (London: Eyre & Spottiswoode, 1964).

that God enters into immediate fellowship with humanity as God's creature. In this understanding, the world itself is not to be condemned, but only "that which is sinful in it." This is not because the world itself is divine, but because it is a divine creation, the handiwork of God. Here an active and voluntary participation of humanity in the fallen creation comes into prominence and thus, not retreating into the religious life of seclusion, but the duty to serve God in every position of life in the world, is now emphasized.⁸⁾ This key idea of Calvinism is explicitly disclosed in its political theory, namely, "the Sovereignty of the Triune God over the whole Cosmos, in all its spheres and kingdoms, visible and invisible."⁹⁾ From this primordial Sovereignty of the Triune God are derived three realms of sovereignty: sovereignty in the state, sovereignty in the society, and sovereignty in the church. These three realms or areas of relationship are referred to as integral wholes, which Kuyper calls "spheres."¹⁰⁾

Then, Kuyper moves to the discussion of the sphere of society, which includes the family, business, science, the arts and so on. All social spheres stand in tension with and are antithetical to the state and do not derive their existence and intrinsic "law of life" from the superiority of the state. Further, for him society is not one homogenous whole, but a number of diverse parts with each part possessing its own

7) This is still considered to be true and significant, even though, as Stackhouse indicates, it cannot be denied that there are strong tendencies to theocracy in Calvinist thought (Stackhouse, "Religion, Society and the Independent Sector," 14-5).

8) Abraham Kuyper, *Lectures on Calvinism* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1931), 30.

9) *Ibid.*, 79.

10) *Ibid.*, 116.

"independent character" and its own sovereignty in the individual social sphere. All these different social spheres have nothing but God above themselves, with each of them entitled to its own unique, inviolable, delegated authority. Therefore the state must neither arbitrarily suppress nor tyrannize others, nor forces its own law on the autonomous spheres of society as a stifling institutional "octopus." Rather, it must adhere to its own function without any tendency to make imperialistic claims, respect the "innate law of life" of those autonomous spheres, and support "every form of life, which grows independently in its own sacred autonomy."¹¹⁾

Kuyper also opposes both radical individualist and revolutionary collectivist social philosophies because both put some form of human sovereignty in the place of the sovereignty of God.¹²⁾ Instead he develops a pluralist alternative to them on the basis of the theological principle that the supreme sovereignty of God presides over both the entire universe and the derived sovereignty of the various social spheres. Both the state and the social spheres are equally divinely obliged to persevere and exert their God-given sovereign authority.¹³⁾ In this sense, all social spheres are to engage in co-existing and pro-existing partnership relationships to each other. Similarly, the Free Church Calvinists understand that each sphere of human community is autonomous and sovereign within its own sphere, and thus one sphere must not interfere nor intrude into others. God ordained every social sphere to fulfill its own

11) Ibid, 90-91, 96-7.

12) Ibid, 85-87.

13) Ibid, 79, 94, 98.

characteristic social mission, duty, and function.

On the other hand, the complex interaction between the various sectors must not be regarded as the only factor in determining the way modern life is shaped. There is another shaper of modern life and it is civilizational developments, which are increasingly influential in bringing new changes to human society. As a result of the new transformation of the axial sectors, new "professional" social sectors come into play in modern civilizations. This new transformation substantially affects, challenges, and thus rearranges the nature and character of every society, culture, and community. This "transition from complex society to cosmopolitan civilization" is in keeping with the Christian conviction of the divine vocation for humans to engage in transforming a fallen world into a place of justice, righteousness, and order. In this perspective, since "traditional patterns of moral convention (which seem to be natural laws)" in a fallen world are in fact "the sinful artifacts of human contrivance," the common life needs to be remodeled anew and so the axial sectors are reordered to be conducive to serving new purposes.¹⁴⁾

More importantly, the rise of modern technical, bureaucratic civilizations brings about new, massive, complex, and global institutions,

14) Max L. Stackhouse, *Public Theology and Political Economy: Christian Stewardship in Modern Society* (New York: University Press of America, 1991), 89. But this should not be taken as contrary to the fact that "[t]o exercise dominion under God, according to God's call, is never to violate the integrity of any creature God has made but to be incorporated into the relation that Jesus Christ has with that creature namely, as the life span in whom, through whom, and for whom all things are called to be God's own." (Christopher Morse, *Not Every Spirit: A Dogmatics of Christian Disbelief* [Valley Forge: Trinity Press International, 1994], 265).

i.e., the "new corporations," which considerably challenge and rearrange the axial sectors and institutions. This newly emerging sector began to take over the social roles and tasks that family, culture, and religion were traditionally responsible for and often alienates us from our traditions and values.¹⁵⁾ As Max Stackhouse points out, the corporations becomes "the primary locus of technology, the primary center of work, and the decisive instrument for creating, accumulating, deploying and organizing wealth in modernity."¹⁶⁾ It is clear that such social inventions of modernity as management and the corporation, along with concomitant new methods in accounting, marketing, and finance, have changed the whole picture of civilization. In particular, technology proves to be unmatched as a social and material force in reshaping the nature and character of modern civilization, and this significant emerging force finds its most focussed and diverse expression in corporations. These corporations are now firmly established in modern society and are pervasive in everyday life, also serving as the organizational alternative to conventional means of gaining access to goods and services. This unprecedented institutional pattern of enormous social complexity pertains to almost all the institutional entities expedient for modern society such as universities, law firms, hospitals, publishers, etc. These corporations are all not only intentionally and voluntarily organized nongovernmental human communities,¹⁷⁾ but their newly differentiated

15) Stackhouse, "Religion, Society and the Independent Sector," 24-5.

16) Stackhouse, "Brunner's *Christianity and Civilization* Revisited: Its Significance after the Collapse of Marxism," in *Theologie und konomie*, ed. Hans Ruh (Zürich: Theologischer Verlag, 1992), 179.

17) Stackhouse, "Religion, Society and the Independent Sector," 25. These non-gov-

social roles also provide people with loci and opportunities to find and practice their vocations.

B. Vocation in the New Testament and the Development of the Monastic Ideal

One of the main features in the biblical concept of vocation is concerned with the emphasis on the "earthly obligations" and thus calling was equated with dutiful fulfillment of responsibilities in mundane life. This sense of vocation is revealed in the "incarnation" of Christ, which symbolically ratifies "the presence of divine intent in the fabric of material life," "the connection of revelation with historical event," and the "prophetic, priestly, and political roles in society."¹⁸) The church thus admonished its members faithfully to carry out "the positions of ordinary responsibility to which they were 'called.'"¹⁹)

However, both a Hellenized Judaic culture and a Roman Imperial political order reconfigured the nature and character of vocation. The main feature of the monastic ideal lies in the shift of its attention from familial, occupational, economic, political, and cultural, to spiritual life, and the separation of clergy from laity with the former focused more

ernmental institutions and programs made a significant contribution to the economic development in Asian countries, which properly reappropriated the corporation in accordance with the given socio-economic context (Stackhouse, "Brunner's *Christianity and Civilization*," 180). However, there seems to be one reservation in applying this assertion to the Korean case, since there was a tendency in the early stage of the economic development in Korea toward the structures of corporate life being to a considerable degree controlled by centralized political authority.

18) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 3-4.

19) *Ibid.*, 5.

on sacramental or contemplative life, and less on work as an ascetic discipline. The laity continued to be involved in the common social life, but the clergy were to be committed to the spiritual life, as clerical status became the primary mode of having a vocation. This condition characterized the rise of priesthood and increased "a stratified model of organization in the church as a model for, but also a model of, the world."²⁰⁾ The influence of Neo-Platonic philosophy produced the outlook of seeing the world, and the society and the church, as a vast "chain of being" ranging from the highest spiritual levels to the lowest inanimate objects on earth.²¹⁾

Then Benedict instituted 'The Rule' that obliged one with a "vocation" to be committed to "communal prayer and work, assuming vows to this end."²²⁾ As this rule came to be the dominant pattern for many orders, the higher ideal involves "the monastic vows of poverty, chastity, and obedience (to the 'rule' of the order, thus not to political authority)." In this process, to have a vocation began to indicate the entrance into either "the secular priesthood" or "the orders of monks or nuns," which became gradually more "sacramental or contemplative, less focused on work."²³⁾ This "religious" vocation was instituted in-

20) Ibid., 7.

21) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 8. However, while calling and office replace birth and status, "a chain of being" gave way to "a chain of command" and universal voluntarism. The Reformed heritage threw attention toward the absolute sovereignty of the will of God in a way to invalidate social hierarchy, with its ranks and ranks of intermediate powers, and thus leveled down all the natural and supernatural levels of powers among all the creatures before an omnipotent God. See also Michael Walzer, *The Revolution of the Saints: A Study in the Origins of Radical Politics* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1965), 7, 163.

22) Ibid., 8.

dependent of "hereditary patterns of ranked status" and "the exercise of coercive power," while "the 'core' of the religious community" was increasingly separated from familial and political obligations.²⁴⁾ An important issue in this period concerned the relationship between the authority of the priesthood and that of the political order and which one had higher authority than the other. This development took place as secular priests bureaucratized and organized into a stratified hierarchical system and the 'prophetic' monastics increased their social influence.²⁵⁾

The medieval, Christian West under the influence of these developments proves similar to and "roughly correlates with" different patterns of relationships between "the priestly-literary, with popular followings, and the political-ruler class, with subjects" in the Confucian, Hindu, and Buddhist traditions. But the theology of 'vocation' served to differentiate the Christian tradition from the others because it transformed "the organizing principles of the dominant modes of social order" in the West. Therefore, "Those called into the higher levels of the church were in principle neither under nor over the political authorities," but maintained their relative independence, say, unlike the literati of China, who were "under" the Emperor.²⁶⁾

A significant historic change in the medieval period was that "the inevitably pluralistic structures of a complex society" were organized

23) Ibid., 8-9.

24) Ibid., 9-10.

25) Ibid., 8-9.

26) Ibid., 10.

in a "hierarchical" way. Nevertheless, "centralization" of the orders entailed that "the independent organization of the 'vocations' brought a new horizontal pluralization of the centers of authority and identity," with church and state, and church and family, respectively, institutionally separated in law, practice, and consciousness.²⁷⁾ There was another important development centered on the church, which has to do with the theological view of "the *vocatio-professio* connection." That is, as the church emerged as the academic center through its cathedral and monastic schools and universities, these institutions nurtured the proper response to one's calling in the sense that

the *vocatio* with its divine origins required a human response -- a *professio*, most especially as a profession of faith, but also as a dedication to develop excellence in a specific area of study in which one was gifted with talent and to cultivate practices that would glorify God and benefit humanity.²⁸⁾

In this sense, church-based organizations were the birthplace of the modern 'professions' such as the professors of higher education and the applied professions of ministry, law, medicine and the "mechanical arts."²⁹⁾ Unlike the analogous cases of other cultural traditions, however, those church-originated specialists did not place the interests of their family or of political authorities before serving God. Some may

27) Ibid., 11.

28) Ibid., 11-12.

29) Ibid., 12.

find the church put "much too constrictive" coercion on their scholarship or professional practice. Nevertheless, "the seeds of an 'independent' set of professions having their own integrity under God, organized outside family and regime, had been planted and watered by the theological baptism that the 'vocational' monastic movements gave them."³⁰) This feature certainly serves to differentiate the 'vocational' monastic movements in the medieval period of the West from other parts of the world with complex civilizations.

C. Vocation in the Reformed Tradition

In regard to the doctrine of vocation, the Reformers rejected the monastic ideal, but did not destroy "the notion of ascetic discipline for those set aside," only transferring "that discipline from the monastery to the hearts of individual believers and to the spheres of ordinary life."³¹) Thus the Reformation espoused a high regard for familial life, "a new ethical discipline in social and political life," and raised the slogan, 'the priesthood of all believers.'³²) The Reformers put emphasis on the "imperfect" and "fallen" nature (both material world and human nature) from God's original intention at Creation and the incapability of any human spiritual activity to achieve its restoration and fulfillment. It was only God's grace that could redeem and transform the fallen nature. Herein a faithful life of prayerful discipleship consists of "living and

30) Ibid., 13.

31) Ibid., 13.

32) Ibid., 14.

working in one's ordinary station in life." Therefore, a true vocation is not to withdraw from "the common fabric of life," but "to live, move, and have [one's] being in the common life filling it, and perhaps transforming it, with a new spirit from within."³³⁾

In the Reformed doctrine of vocation, therefore, our spiritual lives have direct implication for our daily secular activities. God can be sufficiently glorified, not just in the monastery, but in the secular world of work as well. This concept of vocation regards all walks of human life as means to achieve the divinely appointed purpose as God's calling.³⁴⁾ Similarly, Max Weber writes that the divine vocation helps to affirm the secular world as the locus of divinely-intended activity, rather than devaluing or rejecting it as merely creatural and sinful or fallen. This world-affirming attitude finds primary expression in "the inner-worldly asceticism." The characteristic of this inner-worldly asceticism lies in its opposition to retreat from the secular world.³⁵⁾

However, the Reformers did not fully agree with each other in their understandings of the callings of believers or the vocation of the church. The Lutheran tradition argues that believers should "remain" in society as "pre-structured by God-given 'orders of creation.'" From

33) Ibid., 15.

34) Nancy Duff, "Reformed Theology and Medical Ethics: Death, Vocation, and the Suspension of Life Support," in *Toward the Future of Reformed Theology: Tasks, Topics, Traditions*, ed. David Willis and Michael Welker (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999), 311; Task Force on Issues of Vocation and Problems of Work in the United States, *Vocation and Work: Challenge in the Workplace* (Louisville, Ky.: Committee on Social Witness Policy Presbyterian Church [USA], 1990), 50.

35) Max Weber, *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*, trans., eds., and with an introduction by H.H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills (New York: Oxford University Press, 1946), 291.

this point of view, one's calling is understood in reference to "one's *Stand* -- one's social position (*Stelling*), trade (*Gewerbe*) or office (*Amt*) given in the created order of things." ³⁶⁾ This tradition claims that the "spirit of love conveyed through God's grace to the human heart, accepted in trust, and nurtured by 'the Word rightly preached'" can overcome greed, lust, or pretence that may distort one's calling.³⁷⁾ In other words, the Lutheran viewpoint postulates "a recovery of the primal possibilities" given by God in Creation. The human capacity can be restored "to be in communion with God and to serve the neighbor by diligently engaging the given daily task of life together, properly obedient to authority in family, church, and state."³⁸⁾ However, this tradition is often thought to approve "a conservative legitimation of an established social cosmos of ranked order, each level doing its proper job in an organic solidarity."³⁹⁾

In contrast, Calvin is found to differ from Luther in his understanding of the concept of vocation. Calvin's idea of vocation is rooted in the biblical principle (of Romans 4) that "in Christ 'we become what we are not.'" It is claimed that even "one's original location in a pre-determined social order" does not have a controlling influence on the nature of one's status. Luther maintains that unlike the individual lapse from the order of society, the given order of stations *per se* is divinely ordained in accordance with God's faultless intent and thus its goodness

36) Ibid., 16.

37) Ibid., 16.

38) Ibid., 16.

39) Ibid., 16.

cannot be doubted. However, Calvin argues that not just the personal aberration, but also social, political, and economic institutions can become intensely disordered and structurally mirror human depravity and thus need appropriate and continual transformation.⁴⁰⁾ Similarly, "a creational order in the past" does not unchangeably fasten the pre-given structure of labor, the ranks and orders of society, because God's ongoing creative activity continues to bring about "new possibilities" in human life. In this understanding, even mundane occupations such as manufacturing, commerce, banking, and international trade are readily affirmed as God-given "genuine vocations."⁴¹⁾

Paul Marshall argues that the difference between Calvinism and Lutheranism on the concept of vocation is that Lutherans were "driven out to serve" in the fallen world, whereas Calvinists were "unshackled to transform" the imperfect status quo.⁴²⁾ In the later Puritan perspective, the divine intent disclosed both in creation and in the Scriptures is the demand to establish an order in which everything must be open to re-evaluation. This endeavor reflects a "pattern of reformation" in contrast to "a pattern of conformation."⁴³⁾ Along the same

40) Lee Hardy, *The Fabric of This World: Inquiries into Calling, Career Choice, and the Design of Human Work* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1990), 65-7. The emphasis on reconstituting the social world or "social ecology" beyond the personal transformation involving individual action is also claimed by Robert N. Bellah et al. (See their *Habits of the Hearts: Individualism and Commitment in American Life* [Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1985]).

41) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 17.

42) Paul Marshall, *A Kind of Life Imposed on Man: Vocation and Social Order from Tyndale to Locke* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996), 97.

43) *Ibid.*, 99.

lines, Calvin's concept of calling has a tendency to be "aggressive and busy" in character and his followers find themselves urged to make persistent efforts at working, developing, progressing, changing, choosing, and overcoming throughout their lives.⁴⁴⁾

The doctrine of vocation also emphasizes that God places a certain limit on each human life. Calvin argues that the divine calling is "extended by God in part to put limits on human ambition and fickleness."⁴⁵⁾ According to Calvin, God appointed all humanity to a particular sphere of work and its concomitant obligations, because humans are prone to "restlessness" in pursuit of more than what God intended them to be. Therefore God assigned each individual his or her own kind of living "as a sort of sentry post" to prevent reckless drifting around throughout his or her life.⁴⁶⁾ Recognizing the presence of this legitimate limit helps one stay in harmony with who and where we are, and precludes unlawful trespassing beyond the appointed limitations of his or her calling. It is true that Calvin's position is less static than Luther's, and yet one may still criticize Calvin for his tendency at points to encourage a passive and acquiescent attitude toward an oppressive status quo. In fact, strict caution on the "lawful bounds" of our calling can result in psychological discouragement and cause one to remain passive towards an oppressive current situation.⁴⁷⁾

The Reformers' teachings, especially the Calvinist reconstruction of

44) Ibid., 26.

45) Duff, "Reformed Theology and Medical Ethics," 312.

46) Jean Calvin, *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, trans. Ford Lewis Battles (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1960), 3.10.6.

47) Duff, "Reformed Theology and Medical Ethics," 312.

vocation, as a result of the breakdown of earlier Catholic unity, found their ardent and "fertile" adoption in smaller Protestant movements. For the latter, "the occupational order" was "malleable, not "fixed," and "nature itself was subject to radical change ... the use of technology to reconstruct it became a moral duty and an honored vocation."⁴⁸⁾ Their notion of vocation is characteristically more "colletivistic" than other Protestant traditions and prone to "a new social solidarity of dedication" in realizing God's laws and purposes. These sectarian groups had branched out into two contrasting directions. The one was influenced by the earlier monastics and inclined to withdraw from the world. It finds "the true community of faith" to be "'called out' -- out of the world of coercion and politics, and out from technological complexity for the sake of simple living governed only by an ethic of love." From this tradition stemmed the Mennonites, Quaker, and other notable "peace churches," and "the utopian communitarian movements of modern history." In contrast, the other direction understands a calling as "a reforming instrument of God's righteousness and justice in the world, by the use of force if necessary."⁴⁹⁾ Inclined to "a secular hope for a new, revolutionary, classless society," rather than, "faith," this branch is the forerunner of "Christian socialism" and "Liberation theology" and belongs to "the radical reformers of modernity."⁵⁰⁾

Emil Brunner argues that since God created the existing order, adaptation to it is the "*first* point," though not the "*last* point," of a Christian

48) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 18.

49) Ibid., 19.

50) Ibid., 19.

ethic. For him the divine intent is to enrich and enhance the whole creation beyond its natural condition, in an attempt to bring all things into consummation.⁵¹⁾ In fact, adapting oneself to or accepting the existing orders is not the only divine intention, but resisting or reforming them, when they are unjust and oppressive, is also significantly contained in it. In this sense, Brunner rejects a convenient equation of every form of criticism against, and attempt at reform of, the existing orders, as "godless rebellion" against or disobedience to the divinely willed orders.⁵²⁾ But until the better order is actually realized, the currently existing order is the best, Brunner maintains, because "at least it *is* order."⁵³⁾

One other key feature of the doctrine of vocation consists in the divinely-ordained intention for each of us in God's freely-willed summons to glorify God within our different positions and attached duties, and to help others to glorify God and to accomplish their own divinely assigned intention in life.⁵⁴⁾ If the concept of vocation finds eminent expression in that every aspect of life should contribute to the glory of God, the content of vocation does not only include our career pursuits

51) Emil Brunner, *The Divine Imperative*, trans. Olive Wyon (Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1947), 214.

52) Brunner, *The Divine Imperative*, 217. In this sense, "[t]he idea of Providence should be introduced into ethics with great caution; for it has wrought a great deal of harm within this sphere. It threatens to justify the status quo, and in so doing to paralyze the moral will" (Brunner, *The Divine Imperative*, 200).

53) Brunner, *The Divine Imperative*, 226.

54) Nancy Duff, "Call/Vocation," in *Dictionary of Feminist Theologies*, ed. Letty M. Russell and J. Shannon Clark (Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996), 34-35.

in the workplace, but also anything instrumental to the glory of God. This suggests that the concept of vocation is much larger than human work understood as paid employment or a career. It encompasses all aspects of human life. In this understanding, continual attempts at self-cultivation both through one's career and through the other roles we are called upon to play in life can be thought to be true to the vocation that God calls us into. If this is the case, then the concept of vocation needs to be extended to include the moral or ethical dimension, which is ideally inseparable from work or occupation. Further, if all aspects of worldly activities constitute integral parts of our Christian vocation, it is contradictory to assume that we live in two distinct sacred and secular worlds. This notably corresponds with what Charles Taylor means when he writes that Calvinists and particularly Puritans are key contributors to creating one of the underlying principles of modern culture, "the affirmation of ordinary life."⁵⁵

Bearing this in mind, the next section will examine to what extent the Confucian concept of vocation can parallel the Christian version.

III. Confucian Understanding of Vocation

It seems true that the Christian concept of vocation can find only a rough, not exact, counterpart in the Confucian idea, considering that the former was originated and adopted as a major normative concept

55) Charles Taylor, *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1989), 227.

specifically in Christian societies. The discussion of the characteristically Confucian sense of vocation can begin from the Confucian conviction of essential inseparability of the sacred from the secular and its radical affirmation of worldly realities. Confucian culture certainly advanced a distinctive notion of the tension between the transcendental and the mundane, and a particular understanding of its resolution. The characteristic of the Confucian definition of the tension consists in its "relatively secular terms, i.e., in terms of a metaphysical/ethical and not necessarily a religious definition between these two orders."⁵⁶⁾

The relatively secular definition of such tension has to do with a completely this-worldly conception of its resolution, which requires the cultivation of the social, political, and cultural orders, as a primary means to continue the cosmic harmony.⁵⁷⁾ The essential Confucian formula of the secular as sacred can find expression in the key concept of *Chung-yung's* philosophy that transcendental truth, without human conditionality or removed from the earthly experience, cannot constitute the Way. In this sense, the Confucian this-worldly character underscores the sincere fulfillment of everyday tasks within the existing social frameworks as the ultimate criterion of the resolution of the tension between transcendental and mundane orders and of individual responsibility.

Along the same lines, Confucius' great concern to regain the deep

56) S.N. Eisenstadt, "The Axial Age Breakthrough in China and India," in *The Origins and Diversity of Axial Age Civilizations*, ed. S.N. Eisenstadt (Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1986), 292.

57) See Herbert Fingarette, *Confucius - the Secular as Sacred* (New York: Harper & Row, 1972).

meaning of human civilization encourages his followers to avoid withdrawing from the world. The Confucian ethic sufficiently recognizes the importance attached to the embeddedness of human beings in this world here and now. Thus, Tu Wei-ming points out that our becoming spiritual does not come about with the monastic flight from or rising above our immediate environments such as earth, body, family, or community.⁵⁸⁾ However, one should not take active participation of Confucians in the world to mean their total approval of the status quo. They neither appeal only to a transcendent vision as "a source for symbolic action" nor advance a value system totally separated from concrete human life, including the political realm.⁵⁹⁾ Unlike the Taoists disposed to lead a hermit life, they are actively and influentially engaged in the social, political, and educational realms. It is argued therefore that the Confucians understand they are in the world, but certainly not of the world.

Confucians regard self-cultivation as a requirement for regulating the family, governing the state, or bringing peace to the world. The assertion of self-cultivation as "the root" and regulating the family, governing the state, and bringing peace to the world as "branches" significantly implies that moral development must precede the fulfillment of the Heaven-conferred vocation. In addition, this Confucian characterization of self-cultivation as the root holds that political activities can-

58) Tu Wei-ming, "A Confucian Perspective on the Core Values of the Global Community," unpublished manuscript, 8-9.

59) Tu Wei-ming, *Way, Learning, and Politics* (Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1993), 9.

not be separated from moral life and that the latter must be considered prior to the former.⁶⁰⁾ The Confucian concept of vocation, therefore, characteristically gives self-cultivation a priority over the fulfillment of some particular offices. Thus Confucians first undertake strenuous effort at self-cultivation before they engage in a "calling" to fulfill their particular offices. Then the self-cultivation in turn equips the Confucians with the appropriate morality and virtue necessary for sincerely living out their vocations. In this sense, Confucius gives more emphasis to adherence to the Way than to merely holding office. He engages in his own calling to transform the existing human conditions without neglecting to make a great moral effort in persistent adherence to the Way. For him, taking a government post without being sincere in the pursuit of inner growth or simple compliance with the status quo cannot amount to a vocational duty.⁶¹⁾

The Confucian concept of vocation finds a prominent example in the Confucian sociopolitical idea, *ching-shih* (經世), which literally means, "setting the world in order." Fundamental to this Confucian concept of *ching-shih* as the Confucian vocational ideal is the inner-worldly orientation of Confucianism. Unlike Buddhism and Taoism, the defining characteristic of the Confucian vocational ideal lies in a great regard for social activism exemplified in taking a position of leadership and rendering public service to society.⁶²⁾ However, one should not regard

60) Tu Wei-ming, "The Confucian Intellectual in Ancient China," in *The Origins and Diversity of Axial Age Civilizations*, ed. S.N. Eisenstadt (Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1986), 371.

61) Tu, "A Confucian Perspective on the Core Values of the Global Community," 27.

(Neo-)Confucianism as secular humanism because its inner-worldly feature is rooted in a transcendental belief. The Confucian concern with the realization of humanity in this world is transcendently ordained and postulates a "religiously grounded tension with the realities of the existing sociopolitical order."⁶³⁾ In the same vein, the Confucian concept of selfhood is essentially involved in a transcendental aspect that includes the idea of Heaven. The Confucian view of human nature also carries within itself a moral and spiritual dimension, which cannot be fully defined or identified without reference to "the sacred beyond." Therefore, one's particular social nexus alone cannot exclusively claim to provide the sufficient foundation and explanation for the nurture and fulfillment of one's selfhood in the Confucian sense. Since both a transcendently grounded selfhood and a sense of social rootedness and commitment are equally operative as integral parts in Confucianism, the *ching-shih* ideal cuts across the individualism and collectivism division.⁶⁴⁾

The Confucian vocational ideal, *ching-shih*, bases its nature and character on the concept of self-cultivation, which refers to "a process of moral transformation of the self."⁶⁵⁾ One important element in the path of the moral transformation of the self from human nature "in the raw"

62) Chang Hao, "The Intellectual Heritage of the Confucian Ideal of *Ching-Shih*," in *Confucian Traditions in East Asian Modernity: Moral Education and Economic Culture in Japan and the Four Mini-Dragons*, ed. Tu Wei-ming (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1996), 73.

63) Ibid., 73.

64) Ibid., 75.

65) Ibid., 73.

to human nature "fulfilled" is asceticism. Asceticism runs through various Confucian doctrines or guidelines for character discipline, which comprises the exercise of control over desires and emotions and the practice of industry and hard work. The Confucian ideal of self-realization as a basis of ascetic character laden in the *ching-shih* ideal primarily generates an unremitting "drive" to control the inner world of the self.

However, the same unremitting drive fails to be conveyed in the tension with and outlook on the external world of nature and society. The tension was abated by the Confucian viewpoint of "the unity of Heaven and man" that treasures the value of cosmic and social harmony.⁶⁶⁾ Further, the Confucian heavenly principles (*tao*) exhibit "more of a truncated than a full-scale transcendence" and a "full-scale" transcendence, as in a personal, creator God, was never fully realized.⁶⁷⁾ Nevertheless, the advent of Western and/or Christian influence in the modern era served to unfetter the inner-worldly asceticism in the Confucian vocational ideal "held in check by other elements of the Confucian heritage, intellectual as well as institutional."⁶⁸⁾ Moreover, the influence of Western and/or Christian culture weakened the dominance of the imperial subjection, released "a confined instrumental rationality," and enriched "a relative lack of vision" by a more dynamic personalism (than an internal cultivation of the self) about a "development state." As a result, the "marginal" ideal of "collective

66) Ibid., 72-74, 89.

67) Ibid., 77-79.

68) Ibid., 89.

wealth and power" of the whole people, and not only the imperial powers in the pre-modern society, came to the center and gained an increased attention.⁶⁹⁾

IV. Christian Contribution to the Confucian Concept of Vocation

How then can the Christian motif of vocation stabilize and reform the best values in the Confucian ideal of vocation, *ching-shih*? To begin with, the unremitting drive to subdue the inner world of the self that takes place in connection with the Confucian ideal of self-realization was not generalized to include the natural and social world. This is because the Confucian outlook on "the unity of Heaven and man" that treasures the value of cosmic and social harmony served to reduce the tension with the external world of "nature" and society. In contrast, Christian theology, especially the Reformed tradition, finds "nature" to be "imperfect" and "fallen from the state intended by God in Creation." No human spiritual activity can restore and fulfill imperfect and fallen nature because human spirituality is also flawed and fallen.⁷⁰⁾ Therefore there is a tension between the imperatives of a supra-mundane God and

69) Ibid., 89-90. I deliberately used "fundamental cultural turn...to substantial release."

Herein I try to argue that the "cultural turn" was initiated and somewhat progressed, but not fully or sufficiently carried out. The Confucian-influenced society remains to be fully or substantially released from the hold of constricting Confucian cultural elements.

70) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 15.

a creatural world. The Reformed tradition asserts that redemption and transformation of the fallen, imperfect human spirituality can occur only through God's grace. However, this divinely initiated justification needs to proceed to the God-bestowed duty on us to "sanctify," i.e., to transform "the inner heart" and "the outer organization of life." Indeed, we are all called by God to "'reform' social, economic, and political institutions in accord with God's law, purpose, and love."⁷¹) For the Puritans, thus, the use of technology to reconstruct fallen "nature" comes to constitute "an honored vocation."⁷²) Further, the Puritan rational asceticism of living "in" the world and yet not being "of" it helps to develop "superior rational aptitudes" and "the spirit of vocational man" for transforming the fallen world in one's vocation.⁷³)

Second, the Confucian heavenly principles (*tao*) exhibit "more of a truncated than a full-scale transcendence," and a "full-scale" transcendence, as in a personal, creator God, was never fully realized. A "truncated" sense of transcendence corresponds with "political conservatism," because the former means that "the advent of an ideal order in the future would not involve a fundamental break from the institutional order of the present."⁷⁴) As we have seen, Han Confucianism further intensified the "truncated" character of the Confucian *tao*, when the doctrine of the "Three Bonds" came to underlie the core of the

71) Max L. Stackhouse, *Creeeds, Society and Human Rights: A Study in Three Cultures* (Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1984), 59. Italic original.

72) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 18.

73) Max Weber, *The Religion of China: Confucianism and Taoism*. Trans. Hans H. Gerth. New York: Free Press, 1951), 247.

74) Chang, "The Intellectual Heritage of the Confucian Ideal of *Ching-Shih*," 79.

Confucian worldview.⁷⁵⁾ The doctrine of the "Three Bonds" conceives "cosmological kingship and extended lineage" to be not only "integrally fused with Confucian ethics" but also "embedded in an all-embracing cosmic order."⁷⁶⁾ This politicized Confucian ideology of control was involved in aborting important attempts to promote the authority of "teachers' (*shih*) based in the Confucian academies as the custodians of *tao*" to an equal level with that of the imperial rulers. In this process, the vocational ideal of the Neo-Confucian scholars as "a rival center of meaning and authority vis-à-vis the dynastic rulers" was undermined. In contrast, Puritanism is characterized by a "transcendental anchorage of ethics" and an "orientation toward a goal in the beyond."⁷⁷⁾ Different from cosmological kingship and extended lineage deemed as embedded in an all-embracing cosmic order, Calvinists argue that even one's original location in a pre-determined social order does not have a controlling influence on the nature of one's status. Further, a creational order in the past does not unchangeably fasten the pre-given structure of labor,

75) Ibid., 77. The Three Bonds refer to the authority of the ruler over the minister, the father over the son, and the husband over the wife and the Five Relationships include "love between father and son, duty between ruler and subject, distinction between husband and wife, precedence of the old over the young, and faith between friends" (Mencius, *Mencius* IIIA. 4). For a further discussion on the Three Bonds, see Wing-tsit Chan, *A Source Book in Chinese Philosophy* (Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1963), 277-78. It is argued that the Three Bonds fundamentally restructure the Five Relationships into "the 'legalist' mechanism of symbolic control rather than the interpersonal base for the realization of the Mencian idea of a fiduciary community" (Tu Wei-ming, "Probing the 'Three Bonds' and 'Five Relationships' in Confucian Humanization," in *Confucianism and the Family*, ed. Walter H. Slote and George A. De Vos [Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1998], 123).

76) Ibid., 77.

77) Weber, *The Religion of China*, 226-49.

the ranks and orders of society, because God's ongoing creative activity continues to bring about new possibilities in social history.

Third, the Confucian vocational ideal, *ching-shih*, which literally means, "setting the world in order," was fundamentally aimed at the moral elite of society, i.e., "noblemen," positing that only a morally excellent small number of literati are capable of governing. For this reason, the vocational ideal of social activism came to be "politically" oriented and thus it often indicated "bureaucratic service or leadership in a local society."⁷⁸⁾ The increase in political orientation of the Confucian vocational ideal served to narrow down its inner-worldly activism to "the political realm of the social world." Then the civil service examination system contributed to "further" confining the political orientation of the vocational ideal to "bureaucratic service in officialdom and local society." As a result, the Confucian vocational ideal underwent substantial reduction in its range of application and thus closed doors of vocational possibilities.

The Confucian reduction of vocational ideal may be compared to the doctrine of vocation in the development of the monastic ideal during the medieval period in the West, which established clerical status as the primary model of having a vocation. As we have seen, the high Middle Ages reduced the definition of 'vocation' to "the taking of 'religious' vows and entering the brotherhood of the priesthood or the sisterhood of an order of nuns, or, indeed an order of knights."⁷⁹⁾ The clergy with a vocation within the framework of the monastic ideal were dedi-

78) Chang, "The Intellectual Heritage of the Confucian Ideal of *Ching-Shih*," 73, 87.

79) Stackhouse, "Vocation," 10.

cated to a spiritual life distinct from the familial, occupational, economic, political, and cultural life, becoming more sacramental or contemplative, and less focused on work. The Reformers criticized the monastic ideal for limiting the range of vocational application to the spiritual life, restricting the callee to the clergy in withdrawal from the common fabric of life, and thus truncating vocational possibilities. Similarly, the Reformed view of vocation in accord with the underlying principle of the Protestant slogan, 'the priesthood of all believers,' can help restore or expand its reduced range of application on the callee and thus increase vocational possibilities.

In consideration of the above discussion, we see that the Christian notion of vocation can reform and stabilize the best ideas of the Confucian ideal of vocation, *ching-shih*, by correcting an untenable view of human nature and the material world, and helping to fully realize a "truncated" transcendence and increase reduced vocational possibilities.

V. Conclusion

In this paper we have discussed the Christian concept of vocation and its Confucian version, which is presumed to be extant, although probably weakened, in Korean-Confucian society. The Confucian ideal of vocation, *ching-shih*, has revealed that the Christian notion of vocation can find a rough, if not exact, counterpart in the Confucian tradition. However, the Confucian disregard for "fallen" human nature

and material world, "more of a truncated than a full-scale transcendence," and the reduction of vocational possibilities due to turning "politically" oriented and "less morally colored" in nature and character, have suppressed the manifestation of the *ching-shih* ideal. If so, the Confucian vocational ideal may demand the contribution of the Christian notion of vocation to stabilize and reform its best values. The latter is characteristically rooted in such key notions as a tension between the imperatives of a supra-mundane God and a creatural world, redemption and transformation of a fallen, imperfect human spirituality only through God's grace, "full-scale" transcendence indicated in the "transcendental anchorage of ethics" and "orientation toward a goal in the beyond," and the Protestant slogan, 'the priesthood of all believers.' Therefore, this full understanding of vocation can be instrumental in restoring its reduced range of application and callee and as a consequence can increase vocational possibilities.

Moreover, Confucian moral philosophy has a tendency to miscarry systematic or structural reformation, as historically evidenced. In consideration of this reality, Neo-Confucians came to the "realistic" recognition that individual moral heroism, vulnerable to the unjust established institutions, often failed to bring a substantial reform of society as a whole without more fundamental systemic or institutional change.⁸⁰⁾ Therefore, a paradigmatic resource for realizing systematic or

80) Wm. Theodore de Bary, *The Liberal Tradition in China*, (New York, N.Y.: Columbia University Press, 1983), 84. This idea is widely shared among other sixteenth- and seventeenth-century scholars, who highly appreciate the importance of the system or institutions and their reform. This "realistic and practical" statecraft scholarship criticizes and supplements the defect of Neo-Confucian individualism

structural reformation in contemporary Korean-Confucian society may require such Christian ideas as "sphere sovereignty," which can offer an organizational insight and vision for the renewal of society, and the Calvinist emphasis on sanctification beyond justification, which accompanies a divine call to reform social, economic, and political institutions in accord with God's law, purpose, and love. The Calvinist theology, exemplified in such notions as "sphere sovereignty" and sanctification beyond justification, affirms proper and continual transformation of the "outer organization of life" as well as the "inner heart," because social, economic, and political institutions can become intensely disordered, structurally mirroring human depravity. All this argument clearly shows that the Christian idea of vocation can contribute to restoring and enriching the Confucian vocational ideal.

K C I

"without strong constitutional supports of a structural, institutional character" (*The Liberal Tradition in China*, 84).

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Althusius, Johannes. *The Politics of Johannes Althusius*. Trans., with an introduction by Frederick S. Carney. London: Eyre & Spottiswoode, 1964.
- Bellah, Robert N. et al. *Habits of the Hearts: Individualism and Commitment in American Life*. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1985.
- Brunner, Emil. *The Divine Imperative*, trans. Olive Wyon. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1947.
- Calvin, Jean. *Institutes of the Christian Religion*, trans. Ford Lewis Battles. Philadelphia: Westminster Press, 1960.
- Chang, Hao. "The Intellectual Heritage of the Confucian Ideal of *Ching-Shih*." In *Confucian Traditions in East Asian Modernity: Moral Education and Economic Culture in Japan and the Four Mini-Dragons*, ed. Tu Wei-ming. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1996.
- de Bary, Wm. Theodore. *The Liberal Tradition in China*. New York, N.Y.: Columbia University Press, 1983.
- Duff, Nancy. "Reformed Theology and Medical Ethics: Death, Vocation, and the Suspension of Life Support." In *Toward the Future of Reformed Theology: Tasks, Topics, Traditions*, ed. David Willis and Michael Welker. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1999.
- _____. "Call/Vocation." In *Dictionary of Feminist Theologies*, ed. Letty M. Russell and J. Shannon Clark. Louisville, Ky.: Westminster John Knox Press, 1996.
- Fingarette, Herbert. *Confucius - the Secular as Sacred*. New York: Harper & Row, 1972.
- Eisenstadt, S.N. "The Axial Age Breakthrough in China and India." In *The Origins and Diversity of Axial Age Civilizations*, ed. S.N. Eisenstadt. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1986.
- Hardy, Lee. *The Fabric of This World: Inquiries into Calling, Career Choice, and the Design of Human Work*. Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1990.
- Kuyper, Abraham. *Lectures on Calvinism*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1931.

- Marshall, Paul. *A Kind of Life Imposed on Man: Vocation and Social Order from Tyndale to Locke*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1996.
- Mencius. *Mencius*. Trans., with the introduction by D. C. Lau. New York: Penguin, 1970.
- Roels, Shirley J. "Organization Man, Organization Woman: Faith, Gender, and Management." In *Organization Man, Organization Woman: Calling, Leadership, and Culture*, Shirley J. Roels et al. Nashville: Abingdon Press, 1997.
- Stackhouse, Max L. *Public Theology and Political Economy: Christian Stewardship in Modern Society*. New York: University Press of America, 1991.
- _____. "Brunner's *Christianity and Civilization* Revisited: Its Significance after the Collapse of Marxism." In *Theologie und konomie*, ed. Hans Ruh. Zürich: Theologischer Verlag, 1992.
- _____. "Vocation." In *The Oxford Handbook of Theological Ethics*. Forthcoming.
- _____. "Religion, Society and the Independent Sector: Key Elements of a General Theory." In *Religion, the Independent Sector, and American Culture*, ed. Conrad Cherry and Rowland A. Sherrill. Atlanta, Ga.: Scholars Press, 1992.
- _____. *Creeds, Society and Human Rights: A Study in Three Cultures*. Grand Rapids: Eerdmans, 1984.
- Taylor, Charles. *Sources of the Self: The Making of the Modern Identity*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1989.
- Task Force on Issues of Vocation and Problems of Work in the United States. *Vocation and Work: Challengein the Workplace*. Louisville, Ky.: Committee on Social Witness Policy Presbyterian Church (USA), 1990.
- Tu, Wei-ming. "A Confucian Perspective on the Core Values of the Global Community." Unpublished manuscript.
- _____. *Way, Learning, and Politics*. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1993.
- _____. "The Confucian Intellectual in Ancient China." In *The Origins and Diversity of Axial Age Civilizations*, ed. S.N. Eisenstadt. Albany, N.Y.:

SUNY Press, 1986.

_____. "Probing the 'Three Bonds' and 'Five Relationships' in Confucian Humanization." In *Confucianism and the Family*, ed. Walter H. Slote and George A. De Vos. Albany, N.Y.: SUNY Press, 1998.

Walzer, Michael. *The Revolution of the Saints: A Study in the Origins of Radical Politics*. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1965.

Weber, Max. *From Max Weber: Essays in Sociology*. Trans., eds., and with an introduction by H.H. Gerth and C. Wright Mills. New York: Oxford University Press, 1946.

_____. *The Religion of China: Confucianism and Taoism*. Trans. Hans H. Gerth. New York: Free Press, 1951.

K C I