

Foreignizing and Domesticating Harry: An Analysis of the Indonesian Translation of *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*

Issy Yuliasri

Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia

Pamela Allen

University of Tasmania, Australia

This paper discusses the approaches and techniques used to translate vocatives and culture-specific items (CSIs) in the Indonesian translation of J.K. Rowling's Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone. The paper identifies a number of translation techniques and considers their effectiveness or otherwise in dealing with the linguistic challenges of translating a humorous children's story that is embedded in a specific culture. While it is argued that in translating the vocatives the translator's approach tends towards foreignizing, and in translating the CSIs a more domesticating approach is used, it is acknowledged that a translator's choice to foreignize or domesticate may be constrained by external circumstances such as publisher's protocols, the norms and mores of the target culture and 'the position of children's books in the literary polysystem' (Shavit 1981: 172).

Keywords: Harry Potter, Indonesian, vocatives, culture-specific items

Introduction

J.K. Rowling's bestselling Harry Potter series was chosen for this study for a number of reasons. With 450 million copies in print world-wide, and translated into 73 languages¹, the fantasy series ranks among the most widely read children's literary works in history. In Indonesia, the Harry Potter 'phenomenon' has been as frenetic and widespread as in other countries, with over 200,000

copies of each Harry Potter title sold. Although widely read by people of all ages, these novels were written for children, so the challenge for the translator is to maintain the elements that appeal to younger readers. This brings with it the further challenge highlighted by Davies (2003: 68), that younger readers might be less tolerant than adults of obscurity or unnatural-sounding phrasing.

The novels are also noteworthy for the number of CSIs (culture-specific items) in them. They are very British novels, offering 'a rich source of material for anyone interested in looking at how professional translators choose to deal with culture-specific content' (Davies 2003: 67). Indeed, so British was the first book in the series, *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone*, that its publication in America involved a number of changes to CSIs, including the title, where 'Philosopher' was replaced with 'Sorcerer'. This has led some to wonder whether the American edition itself could in fact be considered a translation.

This paper focuses on the first Harry Potter story *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone*. We chose this volume because, as mentioned above, it contains a large number of references to British culture, culture-specific items that we hypothesized would present a challenge to the translator. As in the subsequent Harry Potter stories, there is also liberal use of vocatives in this story. Many of those vocatives are humorous or insulting, adding to the 'edginess' of the humor in the English original. While vocatives may be regarded as an element of CSIs, we chose to examine them as a separate phenomenon because we were particularly interested in identifying ways in which the humor, insult or affection in many of the vocatives were retained in the Indonesian version. Because the Indonesian translator used the American version, *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*, it is this version that we use as Source Text.

We hypothesized that to translate CSIs and vocatives into Indonesian, a language far removed culturally from the British culture of the Harry Potter series, would necessitate the use of a wide range of translation techniques. Molina and Albir's (2002) classification of translation techniques was used, given that it can be used to analyse translation units smaller than sentences. Through an analysis of the techniques chosen by the translator, it is possible to identify her choice of translation approach, i.e. whether it is domestication or foreignization.

A brief explanation about our choice of terminology is warranted here. Because we are using Molina and Albir's classification system, we are using the term 'technique' where other scholars might use the term 'strategy'. When referring to the overarching 'direction' of the translation, namely foreignization or domestication, we have chosen to use the term 'approach'.

The objective of the study was to answer the following research questions:

1. What are the translation techniques used to translate vocatives and culture-specific items in *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* from English into Indonesian, and how are those techniques used?
2. What are the effects of the translation techniques on the rendering of vocatives and culture-specific items in *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* from English into Indonesian?
3. What conclusions can be made about the approach (foreignization or domestication) adopted by the translator to translate vocatives and culture-specific items in *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* from English into Indonesian?

Theoretical Overview

Translation techniques

Translation generally refers to the process of transferring written or spoken Source Language (SL) texts to equivalent written or spoken Target Language (TL) texts. Put simply, the purpose of translation is to reproduce various kinds of texts in another language and thus make them available to a wider readership (Ordudary 2007). Given that readers demand 'naturalness' when reading a translated text, producing an equivalent translated text presents a plethora of challenges to the translator. This is especially true in the translation of culture, idiomatic expressions and figurative language, all of which are features of the novel. As Hu (2000: 1) observes, 'Translation of fiction is much more complicated than the translation of other genres, as it deals not only with bilingual, but also bi-cultural and bi-social transference'. Among the ways the translator solves the problems in translating to produce a good translation of a novel is by exploring and using a variety of translation techniques.

Molina and Albir (2002: 509-511) identify eighteen translation techniques

¹ <http://entertainment.time.com/2013/07/31/because-its-his-birthday-harry-potter-by-the-numbers/>

as follows: 1) adaptation, 2) amplification, 3) borrowing, 4) calque, 5) compensation, 6) description, 7) discursive creation, 8) established equivalence, 9) generalization, 10) linguistic amplification, 11) linguistic compression, 12) literal translation, 13) modulation, 14) particularization, 15) reduction, 16) substitution, 17) transposition, and 18) variation. As discussed below, the Indonesian translator of *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* draws on a number of these techniques.

Translating children's literature

There is a range of diverse, sometimes conflicting, views on translating for children. Some of these views derive from the hegemony of clearly stated cultural norms and expectations whereby, as Rudvin points out (1994: 207) the target language's literary and cultural norms take priority over 'faithfulness'. Those norms may vary considerably from one culture to another, so that what is a challenge for a translator into one language may not be a problem for a translator into another. For example, German translators are expected to replace proper names and culture-specific references with more familiar ones. (Nord 1991) In some cultures, such as Indonesian national culture, there are standards as to what is suitable content for children's books, which circumscribes the work of the translator. In focus groups we conducted with Indonesian readers of children's literature, responses to the question of what constitutes 'good' literature for children emphasized the notion that literature intended for children should model 'good moral values', should be written in 'decent' language and should be 'educational'. This leads to what O'Sullivan (2005: 64) describes as:

the paradox at the heart of the translation of children's literature: it is commonly held that books are translated in order to enrich the children's literature of the target language and to introduce children to foreign cultures, yet at the same time that foreign element itself is often eradicated from translations which are heavily adapted to their target culture...

The role of the publisher in determining a translation approach should not be under-estimated. Indeed, there is evidence that in the case of the Indonesian translation of the Harry Potter novels, the publisher had considerable power

in determining the translator's translation approach. Zulfadli (cited Machali 2012: 80) reports that the publisher provided the translator with a list of words and phrases that should not be translated into Indonesian. The decision to foreignize vocatives, discussed in the findings below, was a publishing decision, not the translator's decision.

Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone was translated into Indonesian and published in 2000 as *Harry Potter dan Batu Bertuah* by Listiana Srisanti, an experienced and prolific translator of children literature until her death in 2010. She also translated children's books from Dutch, German, and French into Indonesian.

The Domestication and Foreignization Dichotomy

The 'paradox' referred to by O'Sullivan above is central to the domestication/foreignization 'dichotomy'. It is almost impossible to discuss literary translation techniques without engaging at some level with the debate regarding the degree to which a translator should make a text conform to the target culture. Broadly speaking, the approach of domestication is aimed at making a text conform as closely as possible to the culture of the target language. This inevitably leads to loss of cultural information and context. Foreignization, by contrast, is an approach that retains information from the source language. This often involves deliberately breaking the conventions of the target language so that meaning is preserved. In his seminal 1995 book *The Translator's Invisibility: A History of Translation* Lawrence Venuti argues that the dichotomy between domestication and foreignization is an ideological one. For Venuti, translation is a powerful political tool. He regards domestication as 'an ethnocentric reduction of the foreign text to target language cultural values, bringing the author back home.' (Venuti 1995: 20) In his view foreignization is the only ethical choice for translators. His premise is that domestication in fact produces only an illusion of 'naturalness'. Furthermore, the strategy of domestication renders the translator and his/her work invisible. (Venuti 1995: 9) In the other 'corner' until his death in 2011 was Eugene Nida, champion of domestication, who argued that 'words only have meanings in terms of the cultures in which they function.' (Nida 2001: 82)

The positioning vis-a-vis translation strategy has thus taken on the characteristics of an ideological debate, but in more practical terms the

dichotomy can be useful in analysing the approach of a translator in translating a particular text. Simplistically, we can say that if the translator emphasizes the SL, s/he tends to adopt foreignization. If the translator emphasizes the TL, s/he tends to adopt domestication. As suggested by Newmark (1988: 45), foreignization with SL emphasis is manifested in such translation methods as word-for-word translation, literal translation, faithful translation, and semantic translation. Conversely, domestication with TL emphasis is manifested in such translation methods as adaptation, free translation, idiomatic translation, and communicative translation. In this paper we employ the terms foreignization/domestication as useful tools for understanding a translator's approach, rather than as indicating a position on an ideological spectrum.

Molina and Albir, whose classification of techniques we use in this paper, prefer to use the term 'translation method' to describe 'the way a particular translation process is carried out in terms of the translator's objective, i.e. the global option that affects the whole text.' (2002: 507). In their classification, translation methods consist of the following: interpretative-communicative (translation of the sense), literal (linguistic transcodification), free (modification of semiotic and communicative categories) and philological (academic or critical translation). They make a connection between translation methods and translation techniques by suggesting that the translation method a translator chooses affects the choice of the translation techniques or the way the micro-units are translated: '... For example, if the aim of a translation is to produce a foreignizing version, then borrowing will be one of the most frequently used techniques.' (2002: 508).

Vocatives

A vocative is a word or phrase used to address a reader or listener directly, usually in the form of a personal name, title, or term of endearment. Other examples of vocatives include implicatures, epithets, appositives and honorifics. As Portner explains (2004: 4), vocatives may occur with all clause types, and need not correspond to an argument. In *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*, many of the vocatives are imperative. While, as Portner (2004: 6) points out, vocatives present 'propositional content' that is separate from the 'central at-issue content', vocatives play an important role in the dialogue in the Harry Potter books, where a lot of bossing around, name-calling and sarcastic put-

downs are done through the use of names, honorifics, titles and nicknames, often in a tone that can be picked up by a speaker of English who is familiar with British humor and insults, but which may be very difficult to transfer to another language and cultural context.

Culture-Specific Items (CSIs)

There is no dearth of definitions of culture. As House reminds us (2014: 498-499), 'the concept of culture has been the concern of many different disciplines', giving rise to a humanistic view of culture encompassing cultural heritage, and an anthropological view referring to the overall way of life of a community. A useful definition for a literary translator is Schmitt's assertion that culture is composed of 'everything that a person should know, be able to feel and to do, in order to succeed in behaving and acting in an environment like somebody from this environment.' (cited Gambier 2004: 33-4)

Whether the translator adopts—consciously or unconsciously—the approach of domestication or foreignization, s/he cannot avoid the fact that every text is anchored in a specific culture, which must be negotiated in the course of the translation. While CSIs of the type discussed below are usually easy to identify, as Newmark points out (1988: 95) cultural customs are often described in ordinary language, necessitating 'an appropriate descriptive-functional equivalent' so as to not distort the meaning.

Baker (1992: 21) coined the term 'culture-specific items' to refer to concepts that may be totally unknown in the target culture. CSIs may be abstract or concrete and may cover both the humanistic and the anthropological dimensions of culture discussed above. Other scholars use different terms to describe these phenomena: Nord (1997: 34) uses the term 'cultureme' and Gambier (2004: 159) the term 'culture-specific references'.

When faced with the problem of non-existence of the referred CSI or its 'different inter-textual status' in the cultural system of the target text, Aixela (1996: 58) identifies two categories of translation techniques: conservation (covers transfer, calquing and glossing) and substitution (covers universalisation, deletion and cultural naturalization).

Research Method

The research method used in this project was Descriptive Qualitative Research. Quantification was used only to provide clear evidence of the occurrence or frequency of the phenomena under analysis. In this study, analysis of the translation techniques was done in order to address the micro-units of the text. Molina and Albir's classification of translation techniques was used to analyse what translation techniques were used by the translator in translating vocatives and CSIs in the novel *Harry Potter and The Sorcerer's Stone (HPSS)*. Further analysis was then made of the effect/ results of the choice of translation techniques on the rendering of meaning or retention of tone.

The translation techniques chosen by the translator were then related to the idea of foreignizing and domesticating. Using Molina and Albir's classification system, it was assumed that foreignizing would be manifested in the use of such translation techniques as borrowing, calque, and literal translation. Domesticating would be manifested in the following techniques: adaptation, amplification, compensation, description, discursive creation, established equivalent, generalization, linguistic amplification, linguistic compression, modulation, particularization, reduction, transposition, and variation.

Conclusions were then made concerning the extent to which the translator of *HPSS* used foreignization and domestication techniques in translating vocatives and CSIs.

Discussion of Findings

Findings of the research revealed that the translator used more foreignizing techniques in translating vocatives. On the contrary, she used more domesticating techniques in translating CSIs (excluding proper names, which are discussed under the vocative heading).

Translation of Vocatives

As mentioned above, in the translation of vocatives foreignizing was the approach imposed on the translator. It is noteworthy that even in cases where there is formal correspondence between English and Indonesian, the English

Table 1. Vocative Translation

*f (frequency)

NO	TRANSLATION TECHNIQUE	TRANSLATION IDEOLOGY	FRE- QUENCY	%	RENDERING OF MEANING/ TONE					
					equal		unequal tone		unequal meaning	
					f	%	f	%	f	%
1	Borrowing	Foreignization	343	81.7	273	65.0	64	15.2	6	1.4
2	Literal translation	Foreignization	6	1.4	3	0.7	2	0.5	1	0.2
3	Calque	Foreignization	3	0.7	1	0.2	0	0.0	2	0.5
SUB TOTAL			352.0	83.8	277.0	66.0	66.0	15.7	9.0	2.1
4	Generalization	Domestication	17	4.0	3	0.7	12	2.9	2	0.5
5	Established equivalent	Domestication	16	3.8	13	3.1	3	0.7	0	0.0
6	Reduction	Domestication	12	2.9	2	0.5	8	1.9	2	0.5
7	Transposition	Domestication	11	2.6	2	0.5	8	1.9	1	0.2
8	Adaptation	Domestication	10	2.4	2	0.5	6	1.4	2	0.5
9	Amplification	Domestication	1	0.2	1	0.2	0	0.0	0	0.0
10	Particularization	Domestication	1	0.2	0	0.0	1	0.2	0	0.0
SUB TOTAL			68.0	16.2	23.0	5.5	38.0	9.0	7.0	1.7
TOTAL			420	100	300	71	104	25	16	4

term of address is borrowed. The vocatives 'Mr' and 'Mrs', for example, could readily be translated as *Tuan* and *Nyonya*, but the English terms are retained.

Table 1 shows the translation techniques used by the translator in translating vocatives and how they resulted in the rendering of meaning/tone.

It can be seen that the translator used more foreignizing techniques (83.8%) than domesticating techniques in translating vocatives. The foreignizing techniques included borrowing (81.7%), literal translation (1.4%) and calque (0.7%).

Borrowing

Borrowing involves the transfer of source language lexemes into the target language, usually without any modification.² In *Harry Potter dan Batu Bertuah*, the Indonesian translation of *HPSS*, the main use of the borrowing technique was in the translation of names such as 'Harry' and 'George'. This has resulted in equivalent translation (65%), despite the foreignness of the sounds of the

names.

Titles such as 'Professor' were also translated, using borrowing, into 'Profesor', resulting in equivalent translation, as such titles are familiar to Indonesian readers. However, the borrowing technique has also resulted in an unequal tone (15.2%) in its use in the translation of 'Sir', 'Dad', 'Mom', 'Dear', 'boy', 'Mr.', 'Mrs.' and 'Miss'. Examples are given below:

Example 1.

ST : I demand that you leave at once, sir
TT : Saya meminta Anda segera pergi, Sir!
BT : I ask you to immediately go, Sir!

Keeping the term 'sir' as it is makes the statement lose its respectful tone, because most Indonesians would understand 'sir' as merely being equivalent to 'Pak' (Mr, a neutral address used for different ranges of status in different situations, from low-class labourers to highly respected officials, in informal to formal situations).

Literal translation

The foreignizing approach was also realized by using literal translation and calque techniques, but not to a significant extent (1.4% and 0.7% respectively). An example is given below:

Example 2

ST : So sorry, your bloodiness, Mr Baron, sir
TT : Maaf sekali, Yang Berdarah, Mr Baron, Sir
BT : Very sorry, The Bloody One, Mr. Baron, Sir

This is a sarcastic pun on the name of the baron (the Bloody Baron). 'Bloodiness' is not a word in English but it works because it is based on other terms of address such as 'your holiness'. The calque technique used in the

translation has resulted in the phrase 'Yang Berdarah' ('berdarah' means bloody or bleeding). This has resulted in a different association from that of the English original text, because in Indonesian there is no such term of address as 'Yang Berdarah' (One who bleeds or one who is bleeding), nor is the linguistic pun transferred.

Domestication in translating vocatives (16.2%) was realized using generalization (4.%), established equivalence (3.8%), reduction (2.9%), transposition (2.6%), adaptation (2.4%), amplification (0.2%) and particularization (0.2%).

Generalization

Among the techniques used to domesticate the vocatives, generalization was the most problematic as it often resulted in unequal tone as seen from the example below:

Example 3

ST : They didn't keep their gold in the house, boy!
TT : Mereka tidak simpan uang mereka dirumah, nak!
BT : They didn't keep their money in the house, child!

In English the vocative 'boy' in this context is a rather patronising term of address, emphasizing the difference in age and status between the speaker and the interlocutor. The emphasis in the difference of age as shown in the English original is not rendered in the Indonesian translation, which uses the general word 'nak' (child), thus shifting its tone/association. Similarly, some generalized vocatives have shifted their meanings or associations. An example is given below:

Example 4

ST : Little tyke!
TT : Dasar anak-anak!
BT : What a child!

While 'tyke' can simply mean 'child' or 'boy' in an affectionate tone, when used as a vocative it has a stronger, more insulting implication, suggesting that the person being addressed is rough or ill-mannered. The Indonesian general word 'anak-anak' simply means 'child', and the phrase 'dasar anak-anak' is

² Newmark (1988: 154) regards borrowing as 'compulsory' in the case of proper nouns, particularly names of people and geographical features, addresses, names of private firms, names of national public and private institutions, terms particular to the institutions, ecology and general culture of the source culture, titles of newspapers, periodicals, books, plays, films, articles, papers, works of art, musical compositions.

simply a complaint about a child misbehaving. It does not carry the same meaning as its original English.

Reduction

Another problematic technique used for domesticating was reduction. Some uses of this technique have resulted in unequal tone in the translation. An example is given below:

Example 5

ST : My dear Professor

TT : Professorku

BT : My Professor

Although it includes the term 'dear', 'My dear' when attached to another term of address (such as professor) is quite formal, indicating that the speaker holds the interlocutor in high regard. In its translation, the tone of respect is gone because of the untranslated 'dear'. It would be equally respectful if it were translated to 'Profesorku yang terhormat' (my respected professor), as in Indonesian the term 'yang terhormat' (the respected one) is the common formal address to show respect, as in a formal letter, an established equivalent of 'dear' as in a salutation.

Adaptation

Adaptation is the the broadest and freest form of translation. Newmark (1988: 62) maintains that adaptation is 'forced' on the translator when no corresponding cultural or institutional custom or object, idiom or expression exists in the target culture or language. Adaptation was used for domesticating vocatives in *HPSS*, although to a limited extent. Some uses have resulted in unequal tone and unequal meaning in the translation as found in the example below:

Example 6

ST : Sweetums

TT : anak pintar

BT : Clever child

Although probably intended as an affectionate term of address (like 'sweetie'),

the word 'sweetums' here could be a reference to the Muppet character Sweetums, a large, hairy ogre with thick eyebrows and a shabby brown shirt, who is actually quite genial. In its Indonesian translation, 'anak pintar' (clever child) is simply an affectionate and complimentary vocative, showing that the interlocutor is a clever child; the humor it carries in its English original is gone.

Other techniques used for domesticating vocatives were established equivalence, reduction, transposition, adaptation, amplification and particularization, which only comprised a small percentage of the translated vocatives.

Translation of CSIs

As mentioned previously, in translating CSIs, excluding proper names, the translator relied more on domestication (90.9%) than foreignization (9.1%), as

Table 2. CSI Translation

*f (frequency)

NO	TRANSLATION TECHNIQUE	TRANSLATION IDEOLOGY	F	%	RENDERING OF MEANING/ TONE OF CSI'S									
					same/ equal		less/ reduced tone		different effect		more intensive		shifted	
					f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%	f	%
1	Borrowing	Domestication	8	24.2	1	3.0	0	0.0	7	21.2	0	0.0	1	3.0
2	Adaptation	Domestication	7	21.2	0	0.0	0	0.0	6	18.2	0	0.0	2	6.1
3	Amplification	Domestication	5	15.2	2	6.1	0	0.0	2	6.1	1	3.0	0	0.0
4	Generalization	Domestication	4	12.1	0	0.0	0	0.0	4	12.1	0	0.0	0	0.0
5	Reduction	Domestication	3	9.1	0	0.0	1	3.0	2	6.1	0	0.0	0	0.0
6	Linguistic compression	Domestication	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
7	Description	Domestication	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
8	Particularization	Domestication	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
SUB TOTAL			30	90.9	3	9.1	1	3.0	24	72.7	1	3.0	3	9.1
9	Literal translation	Foreignization	2	6.1	2	6.1	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
10	Calque	Foreignization	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
SUB TOTAL			3	9.1	2	6.1	0	0.0	1	3.0	0	0.0	0	0.0
TOTAL			33	100	5	15.2	1	3.0	25	75.8	1	3.0	3	9.1

can be seen from Table 2 below:

In domesticating the CSIs the translator used the following techniques: borrowing (24.2%), adaptation (21.2%), amplification (15.2%), generalization (12.1%), reduction (9.1%), linguistic compression, description, and particularization (3% each). Many of the translation techniques used have resulted in problematic translations; a significant number of the translations carry a different meaning and/or different tone/association compared to the original texts.

Borrowing

The borrowing technique used to translate CSIs has resulted in translations with different effects/associations compared to their original as seen from the example of Privet Drive, where Harry's uncle and aunt, Mr and Mrs Dursley, reside. While, as mentioned above, Newmark might consider such borrowing 'compulsory', it does lead here to some loss of associative meaning. The name 'Privet Drive' for a British reader conjures up an 'archetypal suburban image'. (Davies 2003: 93) The Indonesian target readers are not likely to associate the foreign name in the same way as the readers of the source text. In other words, the translation does not have the same effect as the original text.

Adaptation

The adaptation technique used to domesticate CSIs was also problematic, often resulting in translations with different effects/associations. Below is an example:

Example 7

ST : The dishes in front of him were now piled with food. He had never seen so many things he liked to eat on one table: roast beef, roast chicken, pork chops and lamb chops, sausages, bacon and steak, boiled potatoes, roast potatoes, fries, Yorkshire pudding, peas, carrots, gravy, ketchup and, for some strange reason, peppermint humbugs

TT : Piring-piring di depannya sekarang penuh berisi makanan. Belum pernah dia melihat begitu banyak makanan yang ingin dimakannya terhidang di satu meja. Daging sapi panggang, ayam, babi, kambing, sosis, daging asap, steak, kentang rebus, kentang goreng, puding, kacang, wortel, kaldu, saus tomat, bahkan permen pedas

BT : The plates in front of him were now fully contained food. He had

never seen so much food he liked to eat served on one table: roast beef, roast chicken, pork chops and lamb chops, sausages, bacon, steak, boiled potatoes, fried potatoes, fries, pudding, peas, carrots, broth, tomato ketchup, and even hot candies

There is a lot of food in *HPSS*, making it a key CSI with which the translator must grapple. For British – and perhaps even American – readers roast chicken, roast pork and roast potatoes have cultural connotations of family meals and special celebrations. Chops too are a homely, hearty meal, which is not encompassed in simply using the term 'pork'. In Indonesian, 'daging asap' is simply an explanation of what bacon is. Also, 'kaldu' (broth) is not gravy, which is a sauce made from the juices that run from meat or vegetables during cooking. Yorkshire pudding is in fact not pudding at all, but a dish made from batter and usually served with roast meat and gravy.

Amplification

Also referred to as addition, amplification involves keeping the original item but supplementing it with whatever text is judged necessary. Some examples of amplification have resulted in equal translations, but there are cases where the translation carries different associations. An example of equal translation with amplification is given below:

Example 8

ST : 'Weird!' he said, 'What a shape! This is money?'

TT : 'Aneh,' katanya. 'Bentuknya ajaib. Ini uang?'

BT : 'Weird!' he said. 'The shape is magical! This is money?'

The 'weirdness' refers to something that non-wizard children would not find weird at all – the shape of the 50-pence coin, which has 7 sides. The Indonesian version of this exchange uses explicitation/amplification by adding the word 'ajaib' (magical) which accommodates the original effect. The Indonesian translation has sufficiently rendered the meaning of the original English text.

By contrast, an example of the use of amplification technique that resulted in different effect/association is given below:

Example 9

ST : Bonfire Night

TT : Bonfire Night - ... pesta kembang api ...
BT : Bonfire Night - ... fireworks party ...

In Great Britain, Bonfire Night is associated with the tradition of Guy Fawkes Night. The modern event is held annually on or near 5 November, although its significance has been largely lost: it is now simply a night of revelry and fireworks. The Indonesian target readers are not likely to associate the name 'Bonfire Night' in the same way as the readers of the source text, and describing it as a 'fireworks party' does not encompass the historical and cultural allusions embedded in the original. In other words, the translation does not have the same effect as the original text.

Generalization

Another technique used to domesticate CSIs was generalization, which resulted in translations with different associations/effects such as found in Example 10 below

Example 10

ST : It was a tiny, grubby-looking pub
TT : Tempat itu tempat minum kecil dan kotor
BT : That place was a small and dirty drinking place

Culturally, a pub is much more than a 'drinking place'. Formally a public house (a house 'open to the public', as opposed to a private house), a pub is an institution fundamental to British culture. In many places, especially in villages, a pub can be the focal point of the community. (Samuel Pepys described the pub as the heart of England.) Indonesian readers are not likely to know these connotations. In the Indonesian context a pub is associated with a place for drinking alcohol and hanging out. In this translation the word 'pub' is translated into 'tempat minum' which simply means 'drinking place'. Thus, the generalization has resulted in a shifted association/effect in the translation.

Reduction

The technique of reduction was also used to domesticate CSIs, resulting in translations with different tone or meaning. An example is given below:

Example 11

ST : A hundred fat, roast turkeys, mountains of roast and boiled potatoes, platters of chipolatas, tureens of buttered peas, silver boats of thick, rich gravy and cranberry sauce...

TT : Seratus kalkun panggung gemuk, segunung kentang panggang dan rebus, berpiring-piring chipolata berminyak, bermangkuk-mangkuk kacang polong bermentega, bermacam-macam saus lezat ...

BT : A hundred fat, roast turkeys, a mountain of roast and boiled potatoes, plates of oily chipolatas, bowls of buttered peas, different kinds of delicious sauce

Reducing 'silver boats of thick, rich gravy and cranberry sauce' to 'bermacam-macam saus lezat' (different kinds of delicious sauce) removes the cultural connotations of a vast feast with rich condiments and the Christmas association of cranberry sauce—usually only eaten with turkey at Christmas and Easter time. The Indonesian translation does not have the same association to the readers as the original English texts.

Literal translation

Besides the domesticating approach, the translator used some foreignizing, manifested in only two different techniques—literal translation and calque. Both have resulted in translations with a different effect as seen from the example below:

Example 12

ST : ... he was ready to buy as many Mars bars as he could carry—but the woman didn't have Mars bars. What she did have were Bertie Bott's Every-Flavor Beans, Drooble's Best Blowing Gum, Chocolate Frogs, Pumpkin Pasties, Cauldron Cakes, Licorice Wands ...

TT : ... dia siap membeli cokelat Mars Bars sebanyak yang kuat dibawanya – tetapi wanita itu tidak punya Mars Bars. Yang dijualnya adalah Kacang Segala-Rasa Bertie Bott, Permen Karet Tiup Paling Hebat Drooble, Cokelat Kodok, Pastel Labu, Bolu Kual, Tongkat Likor ...

BT : ... He was ready to buy as many Mars chocolate bars as he could carry – but the woman didn't have Mars bars. What she sold were all-flavor Bettie Bott's Bean, Drooble's Greatest Blowing Gum, Frog Chocolate, Pumpkin Pastries, Pan Cakes, Licorice Wands, and ...

The calque translation technique was used to carry over into the translation the nonsensical effect of the names of the candy. The Indonesian translation does not sufficiently render the humor or linguistic effect.

Conclusion

In his comparative study of translations of the Harry Potter books into a number of languages, Davies (2003: 96) concludes that each procedure (what we in this paper refer to as 'technique') 'may be used effectively in some contexts and not in others'. Furthermore, he identifies a lack of consistency on the part of the translators themselves, with 'compromise involving a mixture of procedures' being a way of steering a path between foreignization and making the stories accessible to young people from another culture.

While the present study was not a comparative one, our findings resonate with those of Davies. Our discussion above reveals that in translating the vocatives the translator tended to use a more foreignizing approach, while in translating the CSIs she used a more domesticating one. It is possible to conclude that the foreignizing approach used in translating the vocatives resulted largely in equivalent translation with some unequal tone or meaning. It is also reasonable to conclude that the use of domestication in translating CSIs frequently resulted in a translation that would likely have different effects/association on the target readers as compared to the original text.

But a more useful concluding comment may be made by referring back to Molina and Albir's notion of 'translation method', which avoids the ideologically-loaded terms foreignization and domestication and at the same time allows for a more holistic view of the translation – what Davies calls 'the overall textual effect'. Despite the translation flaws identified in our discussion above, if we look at the translation beyond the unit of the sentence, we can conclude that the Indonesian translator of *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* successfully adopted an interpretative-communicative method of translation, in which some compromises were made, some cultural connotations were lost, some licence was taken but which, at a global level, resulted in a translation that children enjoy reading, even if it is not the same book that their peers in England, America or Australia are reading.

References

- Aixela, J.F. (1996). Culture-Specific items in translation. In Alvarez, R. and M. Carmen-Africa Vidal (eds.), *Translation, Power, Subversion*. Clevedon, UK: Multilingual Matters, 52-79.
- Baker, M. (1992). *In Other Words: A Coursebook on Translation*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Davies, E.E. (2003). A goblin or a dirty nose? *The Translator* 9(1): 65-100
- Gambier, Y. (2007). *Doubts and Directions in Translation Studies*. The Netherlands: John Benjamins.
- House, J. (2014). Translation, interpreting and intercultural communication. In J. Jackson (ed.), *The Routledge Handbook of Language and Intercultural Communication*. Abingdon: Routledge, 495-509
- Hu, Y. (2000). The sociosemiotic approach and translation of fiction. *Translation Journal* 4(4) (online) Retrieved from http://accurapid.com/journal/14_fiction.htm on 12 February 2014
- Machali, R. (2012). Cases of domestication and foreignization in the translation of Indonesian poetry into English: A preliminary inquiry. English Department, Islamic University of Malang (UNISMA), Indonesia (online) Retrieved from http://www.academicjournals.org/article/article1379495872_Machali.pdf on 25 February 2014
- Molina, L. and Albir, A.H. (2002). Translation techniques revisited: A dynamic and functionalist approach. *Meta*, XLVII(4): 498-512.
- Newmark, P. (1998). *A Textbook of Translation*. United Kingdom: Prentice Hall International Ltd.
- Nida, E. A. (1964) *Toward a Science of Translating*. Leiden: E. J. Brill.
- Nida, E.A. (2001). *Language and Culture-Contexts in Translation*. Shanghai: Shanghai Foreign Language Education Press.
- Nord, C. (1991). Scopos, loyalty, and translational conventions'. *Target* 3(1): 91-109.
- Nord, C. (1997). *Translating as a Purposeful Activity: Functionalist Approaches Explained*. Manchester, UK: St. Jerome Publishing.
- Ordudary, M. (2007). Translation procedures, techniques and methods (online) Retrieved from <http://www.translationdirectory.com/articles/article1413.php> on 28 November 2013
- O'Sullivan, E. (2005). *Comparative Children's Literature*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Portner, P. (2004). Vocatives, topics, and imperatives' (online) Retrieved from http://www9.georgetown.edu/faculty/portnerp/my_papers/stuttgart_handout.pdf on 12 February 2014
- Rowling, J.K. (2003). *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone*, New York: Scholastic Press.
- Rowling, J.K. (2008). *Harry Potter dan Batu Bertuah* (L. Srisanti, Trans.), Jakarta: Gramedia,.
- Rudvin, M. (1994). Translation and 'myth': Norwegian children's literature in English.

Perspectives: Studies in Translatology 2(2): 199-211

Shavit, Z. (1981). Translation of children's literature as a function of its position in the literary polysystem. *Poetics Today* 2(4): 171-179

Venuti, L. (1995). *The Translator's Invisibility*. London and New York: Routledge.

Author's email address

issyuliasri@yahoo.com

Pam.Allen@utas.edu.au

About the author

Issy Yuliasri is a lecturer at the State University of Semarang (Unnes), Indonesia. She researches English-Indonesian translations of children's literature and comics.

Pamela Allen is Associate Professor of Indonesian at the University of Tasmania, Australia. She researches contemporary Indonesian literature and translates Indonesian literature into English.