

Qualitative Thought in Dance

Kim, Malborg*

- | | |
|--|---|
| I. Introduction | IV. Qualitative Thought in Dance Creation |
| II. Art Creation and Qualitative Thought | Bibliography |
| III. Movement Quality | 국문초록 |

I. Introduction

Despite the fact that dance has the longest history of all of the art forms¹⁾, its philosophical explanation has been made later than that of film—the newest form of art—due to the perception that dance lacks spiritual value. This prejudice is derived from the misconception, held by many philosophers, that dancers’ work lacks intellectual thought; that dancers frequently become so immersed in the sensual pleasure of movement that they tend to neglect spiritual work, barely expressing a concept or theory in their work. The French philosopher Alain Badiou (1937-) states that there is no “one and only truth” in dance in the strict sense, and thus “dance is not art.”²⁾ Like most traditional philosophers, Badiou has denied the metaphysical value of dance, as he could not find an object of metaphor which expressed a strict and solid meaning in dance.

However, choreographers do not make artistic creations without intellectual thought, nor is spiritual judgment absent from the process of dance creation. Therefore, this study aims to point out evidence for intellectual thought experienced by dancers during the dance creation process as well as explain the process with a new concept. The key point of this discussion is whether we can see dance performance as the outcome of thought or *corps-pensée*. However, what must be pointed out and

* Professor, Ewha Womans Univeristy, eos@ewha.ac.kr

- 1) In 19th century early anthropologists found out that dance has ‘the central and the foundational position’ among other arts in various old civilizations. Dances of these ancient peoples were predicably be primitive and integral to their culture. Related reference see Malborg Kim(2011), *Dance Code*, (Paju: Hangil Art), p.439.
- 2) A. Badiou(1998), *Petit Manuel d’inesthétique*, Jang Tae-soon(Trans.)(Seoul: Ehaksa), p.133.
On the issue of the artistic identity of dance, refer the following articles: 김말복(2015). 니체의 이성비판과 20세기 현대춤의 반향. 『무용예술학연구』, 54:1-19.

explained in advance are the characteristics of artistic thought revealed in the dance creation process. Dancers do not dance or create dance thoughtlessly; they undertake the creative process with many thoughts and contemplations, finally making optimized artistic decisions.

I intend to explain the characteristics of thought of these dancers with the concept of “qualitative thought” developed by the American philosopher John Dewey (1859-1952). Dewey regarded this world as a qualitative world, and argued that people were qualitative beings that had qualitative thoughts and decisions in the world. He was the first philosopher to point out the significance of quality in thought and inquiry. Qualitative being, or qualitiveness, forms the core of Dewey’s philosophical ideology. His ideology, which explains the essence of art as a series of experiences with an aesthetic quality or artistic philosophy, is presented in his book *Art as Experience* (1934), which influenced *Dance: A Creative Art Experience* (1940) by Margaret H'Doubler, who wrote in the field of dance philosophy. Also Dewey’s qualitative theory shed a great influence on Gerald Myers’ opinion that movement quality (Fancher and Myers, 1981) is the essence of dance.

Therefore, the attempt to explain the characteristics of thought in dance using Dewey’s theory is the most efficient approach, as it is founded on an ideological basis that has held great influence in early dance philosophy. This study will first introduce the general theory of artistic process as the grounds on which to explain the characteristics of artistic thought revealed in the dance creation process, as well as examine preceding studies about the qualities of thought in the artistic process in order to explain Dewey’s qualitative thought. Second, this study will introduce Myers’s concept of movement qualities which he claimed as an aesthetic quality of dance. And I will discuss how dancers deal with and think about artistic qualities in the process of dance creation to figure out the object and characteristics of thought in dance.

The research topic is relatively original, as I have not yet encountered any other preceding studies in the field of dance related to this topic.³⁾ However, regarding art creation, I will refer to the contents of M.C. Beardsley’s *On the Creation of Art* (1965) and apply them to dance art. Beardsley’s research on the art process is widely known for its depth of research. Beardsley studied the art process under Dewey’s ideological influence, and thus his research has a theoretical framework suitable for this research topic, as it intends to investigate the characteristics of artistic thoughts in the artistic process. Dewey’s ideology is mostly covered pedagogically in Korea; his art philosophy is constantly covered by Jung Soon-bok (1990, 1996, 2005), while research by Kim Yeon-hee (2012) discusses creativity and Dewey’s qualitative thought in association. This study is distinguished in that it applies Dewey’s qualitative thought as a concept that explains the characteristics of artistic thought in dance creation.

3) Philosophical studies related to ‘qualitative thinking’ are as follows: 김연희(2012). 예술과정으로 본 창의성의 기원. 『미학』, 70: 35-73; 정순복(1990). 존 듀이의 철학에 있어서 ‘질성’과 예술의 문제. 『미학』, 15; 정순복(1996). 존 듀이의 형이상학. 『미학』, 21; 정순복(2005). 존 듀이의 예술 철학: 형성과정, 방법론적 토대 및 예술의 본질. 『미학』, 44.

Therefore, based on the discussions of the aforementioned scholars and on Dewey's theory, an indirect refutation of Badiou's view of dance may be possible.

II. Art Creation and Qualitative Thought

Considering creativity and the artistic process, people generally tend to connect an artist and a creator rather than separate them. However, an attitude which gives them equal consideration has recently been formed. In the Greek period, there were no words such as "create" or "creator"; the term "to make" (poiein) only applied to poetry. Visual art was merely a technique of making an object, which was imitation rather than creation. In this regard, a person was required to apply the technique of imitation to the knowledge or principles of rules in order to be an artist. In the Greek period, people referred to the rules or principles of such art production as canonormos, which means "measure." These are the initial concepts we encounter as the evidence of thought or knowledge related to artists' art production.

However, the concept of creativity changes greatly upon entering the modern era, as various terms gradually flow into art theories which give human artists the ability to create. The modern era has not yet equaled the medieval era's concept of creation, which considered "creation" to be the act of God creating something out of nothing. Those terms, while inferior to the expression "creativity," included words like "excogitate" (excogitatio, M. Ficino), "turn imagination into reality" (B. Michelangelo), "devise" (Paolo Pino), and "fiction" (finzione, F. Patrizi). By the eighteenth century, the concept of creativity became connected to the concept of imagination. In the nineteenth century, the traditional idea that art is not creation was replaced by the idea that only art is creation. The root of this fundamental change was enabled when the belief that something is created "out of nothing" was eliminated; art creation became something that made new things, akin to producing a fictional being.

Thanks to the development of psychology and cognitive science in the mid-twentieth century, the concept of creativity has been modernized into a broader sense that applies not only to art and science but also to all human actions and productions. The modern concept of creativity emphasized "novelty" in new thoughts, styles, models, actions, and work production methods. The psychologist J. P. Guilford proposed that the core of creativity was in "divergent thinking," which contributed greatly to changing the concept from creation as a production to the idea of thought from the mid-twentieth century. Thus, the current evidence of creativity is "novelty shown in a certain action or work."⁴ Thoughts in this direction have diversified, from considerations of creativity as novel and imaginative problem solving to the creative thinking of free play.

4) W. Tatarkiewicz(1980), *A History of Six Ideas*, Son Hyo-joo(Trans.)(Seoul: Art Culture), p.312.

So far in the discussion we have examined “production by rules,” “imagination,” “devise,” “fiction,” “novelty,” and “divergent thinking,” which all point out the core or characteristics of the thoughts and ideas of artists during the process of creation. I presume that their existence and application may appear more specifically in research about the artistic process by differentiating the approach. Beardsley refers to the creative process as a “mental and physical activity between the incept (short for “inceptive element”) and the final touch.”⁵⁾ Many theorists made efforts to generalize the research on patterns of qualitative creation by depending on the statements of artists. In his book *The Art of Thought*, Graham Wallers divided the artistic process in the order of preparation, incubation, inspiration, and elaboration. But Beardsley saw these four activities as coexisting and occurring in a cross-sectional manner throughout the entire creation process.

To examine the mediation and control displayed by artists in the process of creating artwork, Beardsley divided the process into incept, development, and completion, in order to discuss the artistic thoughts and decisions of artists based on their own statements. Beardsley then argued that, while there is no universal stage in the artistic process, there are two apparent phases that intersect constantly throughout the entire process, including interactions between consciousness and preconscious: “the inventive phase, traditionally called inspiration, in which new ideas are formed in the preconscious and appear in consciousness. And there is the selective phase, which is nothing more than criticism, in which the conscious chooses or rejects the new idea after perceiving its relationships to what has already tentatively been adopted.”⁶⁾ Even as he examined this artistic process in stages, he stated that “the true locus of creativity is not the genetic process prior to the work but the work itself as it lives in the experience of the beholder.”⁷⁾ In other words, important creativity exists inside the operation of artwork, and in those in the audience who discover a feeling of spiritual vitality or an impression of a new vision and understanding.

In the conclusion of his research he indicated that “the finest qualities of art work cannot be imposed on it directly and by fiat; the artist can, after all, only manipulate the elements of the medium to make the quality emerge.”⁸⁾ In other words, just as a composer composes outstanding melodies by seeking the connection of tones with certain qualities, art creation is merely a product of a “self-creative object.” David Ecker conducted a qualitative examination of the process of art creation slightly before Beardsley. Citing Dewey’s concept of qualitative thought, he regarded the creative process as a process of “qualitative problem-solving.” According to Ecker, art creation consists of consecutive problems and solutions; for artistic problems, “problem-solving occurs in an artist’s media”⁹⁾ such as, for instance, “this zigzag form makes a strong contrast with that broad space.” Ecker

5) M. C. Beardsley(1965), *On the Creation of Art*, *J.A.A.C.* 23(3), p.291.

6) *Ibid.*, p.300.

7) *Ibid.*, p.302.

8) *Ibid.*, p.303.

argued that artists use qualitative media—such as lines, colors or textures—to accomplish the qualitative goals of their “end-in-view.”

Both Beardsley and Ecker point out that the object of artistic thinking in the artistic process is quality. Their ideas all originate from Dewey’s theory of qualitative thought. John Dewey is one of the most eminent philosophers of the twentieth century; his ongoing influence is seen in how his argument for the continuity of aesthetic experiences in daily life, presented in his main book *Art as Experience* (1934), is still actualized in today’s enjoyment of art and lifestyle. Dewey argued that the world in which we live is the qualitative world, and the decisions we make in our lives are qualitative considerations and qualitative determinations. He raised qualitateness as a significant philosophical issue, while at the same time connecting it to the issue of art. Dewey argued that an artist’s thoughts, such as the determination of artwork or logic of artistic construction, possess the logic he calls “qualitative thought.”

Dewey suggested the significance of qualitative character when we experience nature, an argument which acknowledges an uncertain and incomplete qualitative being in nature as the essence of knowledge, the cognitive value of which had not been traditionally acknowledged in terms of thought and investigation. While traditional philosophical thought has the problem of “relations” among events or objects, in his book *Philosophy and Civilization* (1931) Dewey argues that “underlying and pervasive quality is acknowledged in a distinct logical formulation.”¹⁰⁾ He went on to state, “That is, the quality, although dumb, has as a part of its complex quality a movement or transition in some direction. It can, therefore, be intellectually symbolized and converted into an object of thought.”¹¹⁾ Dewey argued that this “underlying and pervasive quality” must essentially consider the meaning of regulation on thoughts.

When we look at a certain object, our thoughts about that object are mediated and regulated by a situation; the situation as a whole has an intrusive and internally integrated property that includes the object. “The situation as such is not and cannot be stated or made explicit. It is taken for granted, “understood,” or implicit in all propositional symbolization.”¹²⁾ Therefore, the background for our daily thinking is the situation that controls our thoughts about the object, which become the clues that compile our thoughts while at the same time determining our “terms of thought.” He goes on to state that artwork is the example that best displays the cognitive qualitative character in this situation, with intuitive artistic construction and appreciation as typical examples of qualitative thoughts.

“A work of art provides an apter illustration. In it, as we have already noted, the quality of the whole permeates, affects, and controls every detail. ... The details fall to pieces; they are not distinctions of

9) D. Ecker(1963), *The Artistic Process as Qualitative Problem Solving*, *J.A.A.C.* 21(3), p.285.

10) J. Dewey(1931), *Philosophy and Civilization*(New York: Minton, Balch & Company), p.97.

11) *Ibid.*, p.107.

12) *Ibid.*, p.98.

one subject-matter, because there is no qualitative unity underlying them. Confusion and incoherence are always marks of lack of control by a single pervasive quality.”¹³⁾ As such, the artistic thought in Dewey’s philosophy is not different from other general thoughts, as it constantly points out that an artist’s logic of construction in thinking is based on the understanding of the quality of the overall situation. Moreover, artists’ work is a pure case that most well illustrates “the process of mediation in which various parts of an artwork are selected, establish relations, and are integrated by a single qualitative whole.” Dewey argues that this quality mediates the artist’s artwork in the beginning and throughout the entire creation process, but the quality only exists wholly after the artwork is completed; thus it was inside the artist’s mind first.

Dewey’s concept of qualitative thought raised an alarm for the awareness of art production and appreciation as a traditionally emotional or sensuous experience, and thus irrational or lowbrow. For Dewey, qualitative thought is an example of extremely high-level cognition; it is innovative because it explains the process by which thoughts are created and completed, as well as how their meaning is acquired based on indefinite and unclear qualitiveness. He is perhaps the first philosopher to so deeply and systematically discuss the process of art and artistic individuality using terms such as “thought” and “cognition.” Therefore, as it can be seen from this study, his ideology is still passed down by scholars of various fields even today.

III. Movement Quality

Gerald Myers raised the question “Do You See What the Critic Sees?” and answered that we will see the qualities of movement if we see dance critically. Myers thinks that movement qualities are “the bottom-liners in an exposition of what is special about the art of dancing,”¹⁴⁾ even though there are elements in dance other than movement qualities, such as the motion of dancers, choreography, use of music, costumes, props, lighting, and harmony of space and time. While he suggested movement qualities are the artistic characteristics and identity of dance, he fell into a philosophical dilemma to explain their existence.

After declaring that “the aesthetic quality of dance is the qualities of movement,” Myers, who was familiar with philosophical ways of thinking, demonstrated that they truly and objectively exist. In the process, some critics were offended as he pointed out that it is not appropriate to regard the image inside an artist’s head as the object of criticism. He made this point after he examined the key object for the artistic evaluation of dance experts by reading articles of various critics, finding that Arlene

13) Ibid.

14) G. Fancher and G. Myers(ed.)(1981), *Philosophical Essays On Dance*(New York: Dance Horizons), p.37.

Croce made comments on dance based on “afterimages.” Discussion on insubstantial images in the memory cannot be established philosophically. Therefore, he thought that the theme of dance criticism must be the actual dance performance, instead of memories of the dance. He himself tried to find the key object for appreciation of a dance performance.

Like most aesthetic characteristics that are unclear and difficult to capture—and unlike the characteristics of daily-life objects—the characteristics of movement qualities cannot be seen universally; thus, he intended to clarify the cause of such a special experience and the object of cognition. In Myers’ view, the qualities of dancers’ subtle and fading movements captivate dancers and critics, and therefore become the most fundamental and significant object of cognition when dance enthusiasts appreciate dance.

Myers examined, in critics’ texts, how focused on movement qualities an audience was when viewing a dance performance, as they not only saw the dancers’ motions but also the qualities of movement. “... if Jose Limon wasn’t dancing solo, he seems to have needed the strength and size of another man to match his own.” (Marcia Siegel), “Neither man was really a sensual dancer, but where Hoving was balletically vertical and rather brittle in his movement, Limon was tight and strong” (Deborah Jowitt).¹⁵⁾ Moreover, Jowitt used the terms “terrific lightness, fluidity, delicacy, and restraint” as she described Gelsey Kirkland’s dancing; each of these words implies what he understands as a movement quality. As a philosopher, he sees that two dancers may execute the same movement, but one is praised over the other because hers was fluid whereas the other’s was fudged, a difference which he claims must be the object of art appreciation. “In all the arts the basic item of appreciation is ‘aesthetic quality’—the quality of the brush stroke, the quality of the sound, the quality of the oral delivery, and so on. In dance, it is the quality of movement.¹⁶⁾

After presenting these movement qualities as the key identity of dance, he intended to examine the vagueness of words such as “brittle,” “light,” and “fluid” more objectively and clearly by quoting terms indicating the aesthetic quality of dance. He tried to avoid the view that judgment of the movement qualities was only a subjective reaction, similar to emotions or something inside human eyes. He consider that something in the dancer’s movements would create light, heavy, or fast feelings for those watching it, due to its objective elements. However, these elements give the impression of a subtle and vague disappearance, since the elements that form such qualities do not exist individually but instead occur as an inseparable part in the larger context of a dance performance. “When you see the lyrical quality of the dancing, you cannot, even in imagination, detach the lyrical quality from the dancing for independent consideration, because it is too much a perceptual ‘part’ of the dancing itself. It is ‘in’ the movement as if a pain is ‘in’ one’s knee; you don’t find the lyrical quality by dissecting the

15) Ibid., p.38.

16) Ibid., p.9.

movement any more than you can point to something that is the pain by surgically opening up the knee.”¹⁷⁾

These qualities cannot be clearly captured or perceived because the aesthetic qualities of dancing pervade in the whole performance. Myers said the sliding quality of a dancer’s movement is more like the “cool quality of blue or the warm quality of red” than the actual colors we perceive. The perception of color in a performance may differ according to lighting or atmosphere and thus cannot guarantee objectivity. However, the objectivity of the perception of movement qualities is much more in jeopardy than the perception of relatively general and external colors. This is because we may agree that the color of a certain costume is blue or red, but we may not agree that the blue is cool or the red is warm. Therefore, Myers argued that our perception of blue being cool is “dependent upon our frame of mind, upon whether our perceiving emphasizes this or that feature of the thing we see, and upon, generally, our preconceptions.”¹⁸⁾ What we see is determined partially by our expectation of or theory about the object, as well as the ideas that form the hypothesis or guidelines.

Myers said the movement qualities that are the most fundamental and important cognitive elements in appreciating dance are “the comprehensive results of personality, height and weight, involuntary mannerisms, rehearsed efforts, or musical response, the whole body, or only isolated parts.”¹⁹⁾ Thus, these various elements create the artistic qualities of the artwork represented by the dancer himself. A perspective of thought attuned to the dancer’s body is required to see the subtle movement qualities displayed by the dancer. One must have knowledge of or experience with the dance techniques, choreographic traditions, and relations with other works in order to simultaneously perceive movement qualities that quickly slip away. What Myers ultimately argued is that one can appreciate dance well and grasp the true identity of dance phenomena when they can confidently look beyond physical characteristics and perceive the qualities derived from them. To perceive the qualities well, it is necessary to know the theories and guidelines of dance that created those qualities, as well as the major value concepts and perspectives.

In other words, for the audience to appreciate the movement qualities of a certain ballerina, they must have the experience of seeing many ballet movements along with the understanding of ballet techniques, styles, motion values, and choreography. Moreover, knowledge of the traditions and history of ballet provide the framework with which they see or understand these characteristics. Now let us change the direction of the question: if what the audience ultimately sees in dancing is the quality of movement, what do choreographers deal with and think about in the process of choreography? This will be examined in the following chapter.

17) Ibid., p.45.

18) Ibid., p.46.

19) Ibid., p.48.

IV. Qualitative Thought in Dance Creation

Combining Myers' view that what we see in dance is quality with Dewey's concept that the qualitative character is the situation that influences the perception of an object, I suggest dance is the field of dynamic forces that mutually and qualitatively interact and change in terms of characters. In the process of creating dance, choreographers cause qualitative changes in the dance situations; I wonder what process or thoughts they undergo for such dynamic and qualitative changes.

Beardsley combined the statements of artists at the two extreme ends: the idea that forms the incept of artwork continues without change until the end and the idea that it is impossible to figure out from the first impression how the final version will end. He said that one thing is clear: once an element that forms the incept of an artwork is chosen, "it sets up demands and suggestions as to what may come next, and also places limits upon it."²⁰ Dewey said that thinking is a good example of an artistic construction that mediates parts and types of integration of their relations by a single qualitative whole, while also pointing out the integrated and mutually regulative characteristics of thoughts in artistic construction. This is done in order to create a single unified qualitiveness. Artwork, as a character, forms a foundation that reveals the dominant character; when fails to do so, the artwork is evaluated as a failure.

When we see a certain artwork, we instantaneously perceive it as a G. Balanchine's ballet or V. Gogh's painting before we analyze it in detail. This is a judgment based on dominant characteristics spread throughout the entire artwork. The thought is caused by the perception of the overall situation, which is created by qualities through which various elements of the artwork are internally integrated and pervaded. If we fail to understand the situation, then we cannot explain that artwork. When qualitative unification is not found in the entire work, its various elements shatter into pieces and the audience experiences confusion and inconsistency. This is caused by the lack of an artistic view or mediation by a single dominant quality that penetrates the entire work.

Therefore, it is the first movement, or a dancer's qualitiveness with an idea or theme, that forms the incept of the work that is mutually linked to the various qualitative elements that follow or occur simultaneously with the movement, and thus must be mediated. Qualities of various elements present in an instant or over the course of an artwork mutually influence and pervade each other in a mutual relationship. This basic unification and harmony of qualitiveness forms the background of an artist's thoughts. Dewey said "the materials of the fine arts consists of qualities,"²¹ pointing out that thoughts in art deal with satisfactory emotional qualities. Then he argued that artistic thought is as intellectual and thorough as scientific thought, saying, "An artist, in comparison with his fellows, is one who is not

20) M. C. Beardsley(1965), p. 298.

21) J. Dewey(1934), *Art as Experience*(New York: Minton, Balch & Company), p.38.

only especially gifted in powers of execution but in unusual sensitivity to the qualities of things. This sensitivity also directs his doings and makings.”²²⁾

Generally, intellectual thought uses signs or symbols, while artists deal with the qualities of their media to create internal convergence and completion through orderly and organized movement. Thus choreographers must grasp the relationship among incept movements, other movements connected to the previous dancer’s qualitiveness, and other dancers. Such comprehension is a process that is as intellectual as scientific thought. Most thinking tends to be limited to or equated with dealing with text or language, but grasping the relationship among the artistic qualities and thinking effectively about them is an intellectual task as difficult as mathematical thinking. In fact, thoughts that deal with subtle qualitiveness, more than thoughts dealing with systematic language, may require a sharp intellect that extends beyond thinking.

A choreographer’s thinking is directly specified within objects such as dancers and music, his media. As Dewey mentioned, choreographers are immersed in the objects they create, thinking and creating an artistic language within their qualitative media in a state of emotional being in convergence with their media and with an artist’s unique and outstanding sensibility. They grasp the individual relations of the movement they conducted and the movement they will conduct, and find stability and order in the whirlwind of various qualities. In each stage of choreography, they grasp the state and characteristics which contribute to the mutual penetration of these qualitative media, choosing their individual relations and in the end intentionally controlling how this artwork must be naturally experienced and perceived by the audience. Therefore, “an artist embodies in himself the attitude of perceiver while he works.”²³⁾ A choreographer does not work in an irrational state, possessed by his muse in the creative process, but focuses on the quality of dance that must be “perceived” by the audience while regulating artistic decisions based on that focus. The German choreographer Pina Bausch decided on her final choreography after completing a tentative choreography and offering previews to various people for months; a process of selection and determination that experiments with the recognizers’ responses and leads toward the qualities she desired.

The dancers of the New York City Ballet, known as “Mr. B’s Ballerinas,” have a physical image that complies with Balanchine’s unique ballet. Balanchine adjusted the physical appearance of female dancers to suit his ideal. He selected female dancers according to a body type, typically slim and slender females who had neatly-shaped heads and long, skinny limbs. This preference became imprinted as a unique image of a dancer in the contemporary trends, and was lovingly given the

22) Ibid., p.94.

23) Ibid., p.48. Also on the matter of how a dancer’s body is perceived by the audience, please refer the following article: 김말복(2011). 컨템포러리댄스의 몸. 『무용예술학연구』, 34: 1-27.

nickname “Mr. B's Ballerina.” Of course, the new physical quality of dancers was not the first of Balanchine’s innovative achievements, but it is clearly a quality penetrating Balanchine’s ballet style alongside his quick-tempo technique. He also made his dancers dance in tight practice suits to optimize his ability to discover the true beauty of a well-figured female body. The costume stands alongside his other innovative accomplishments, though it must be noted that the physical quality of his dancers and his choice of costume are not individual decisions but mutually connected and regulated. Without the premise of superior and perfect body lines, they would not have performed on stage with costumes that revealed their bodies as if they were under the microscope.

Thus, the characters of dancers can be referred to as the primary quality in dance media. The movement qualities Myers saw as the fundamental characteristic and the aesthetic quality of the dance’s art were fundamentally realized by the dancers’ bodies. Myers said that movement qualities were the comprehensive result of a dancer’s personality, height and weight, involuntary mannerisms, rehearsed efforts, musical response, and physical characteristics. Certainly, only one or two of these elements can be used to create a different quality in movements of the same structure without involving all of the other elements Myers mentioned. However, these various elements each contribute to expressing different qualities of the movement within the same structure. Therefore, choreographers who can distinguish not only physical characteristics of dancers but also perceive, with confidence, the qualities derived from them are more likely to create excellent dance. Unlike primary media characters in other forms of art, the primary quality of dance has a significant artistic influence.

However, physical characteristics cannot complete the aesthetic quality of a dance by themselves; the artistic situation in which the dancer’s body exists completes the aesthetic quality actualized by the dancer’s body. The movement of a dancer and its quality as the object viewed by the audience is unclear, but it has movement toward a certain direction due to its autonomous character. For instance, from a dancer with a certain body type or the quality of A, we tend to think of steps or motions that are similar to A. An outstanding choreographer has a sharp sensibility capable of capturing the movement and tendency of this quality.

On the other hand, the situation or context surrounding the object of a certain movement becomes a clue, mediating and affecting our thoughts. Situation as an entire work, including the object, has the context of space and the flow of time. Moreover, the situation of time and space does not exist individually and separately from the whole work, but undergoes internal convergence and mutual regulation. In other words, the same movement can be perceived to have a completely different character according to the following movement, its relationship with other simultaneous movements, or its harmony with other accompaniment. This is because the qualitative character of a specific dance situation affects and regulates the dancer’s body and movement as the object, surrounding them as a

single unified whole. The secondary quality of dance is what is synthetically perceived in this dance situation. To perceive and control this secondary quality, a sensitive perception and thorough experience with dance are necessary.

Whenever various artistic decisions and choices are made in the creative process, the qualitateness of work constantly changes.²⁴⁾ In this phased-in process of change, it is extremely important to understand the overall quality of the situation. Among all the abilities of thought, intuition is what perceives this qualitateness. Intuition is needed to perceive the qualitateness underlying all the details of explicit reasoning about a certain object that we see. To intuitively understand a certain object as “that river” or “Ah, that John” is to perceive the specific qualities underlying that object. Dewey follows Bergson’s view that “intuition precedes conception and goes deeper.”²⁵⁾ Identifying an arrangement of certain forms or the identity of a pattern in a dance performance is only possible when there is a premise of forms or patterns of other comparable movements or dancers.

A dancer’s body and certain movements in a performance must be in qualitative unity with the underlying and pervasive quality in order for that work to have aesthetic quality and to be easily understood in terms of artistic characteristics. Therefore, to perceive the secondary quality of a work, it is necessary to grasp how various elements mutually pervade and affect one another over the course of time, while balancing and integrating them in order to have a unity which conforms to the theme with a single qualitative view that penetrates them as a whole.

As with Beardsley’s creative process, choreographers, in the inventive phase of conscientizing new ideas referred to as inspiration, choose dancers with certain qualities and incept work based on motif movements suitable for the theme. They then undergo the process of selecting, simplifying and clarifying the qualitative problems created by various media, according to their thoughts and views of their work. For their work to be explicitly perceived as a single unified qualitative experience, they often follow the technique or form of art that organizes time and space, or they make their choices based on the flow of their imaginative emotions. In the process, they undergo a selective phase in which new ideas are accepted or rejected according to the decisions of precedent and provisional qualitative problem-solving. Consequently, choreographers make choices and decisions that reveal desired qualities by dealing with dance media.

The artistic situation of such work raises diverse qualitative problems and introduces the ever-changing field of dynamic forces right up until the final moment. The qualitative situation develops and changes constantly, while choreographers establish a single unified experience. A

24) When a dance or dancer’s body is digitally processed then the image of the dance changes drastically. Please refer the following article: 김말복(2012). 디지털 영상시대 무용수의 몸. 『무용예술학연구』, 37(4): 63-84.

25) J. Dewey(1931), p.101.

choreographer brings order to the qualitative elements of his work based on his perspective and interest, turning the qualities of his different media into a single, integrated whole through intuitive decisions and imaginative associations. A new work of dance is created when this imaginative and qualitative problem-solving assumes the form. Here, imagination is key to regarding the objects as one integrated whole, establishing a single unified experience in the perception of the appreciator. Art operates in a sensuous manner. Artwork is completed as experiences of aesthetic quality flow through consecutive situations within the viewer's sensations, and, as a result, that work of art has meaning and characteristics.

■ Bibliography

- Badiou, A(1998). *Petit Manuel d'esthétique*. Translated by Jang Tae-soon. Seoul: Ehaksa.
- Dewey, J(1931). *Philosophy and Civilization*. New York: Minton, Balch & Company.
- _____ (1934). *Art as Experience*. New York: Minton, Balch & Company.
- Fancher, G. and G. Myers(eds.)(1981). *Philosophical Essays On Dance*. New York: Dance Horizons.
- Kim, Malborg(2011). *Dance Code*. Paju: Hangil Art.
- Sternberg, R.(ed.)(1999). *Handbook of Creativity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Tatariewicz, W.(1999). *A History of Six Ideas*[1980]. Translated by Son Hyo-joo. Seoul: Art Culture.
- Wallas, G.(1926). *The Art of Thought*. London: Jonathan Cape.
- 김말복(2011). 컨템포러리댄스의 몸. 『무용예술학연구』, 34: 1-27.
- _____ (2012). 디지털 영상시대 무용수의 몸. 『무용예술학연구』, 37(4): 63-84.
- _____ (2015). 니체의 이성비판과 20세기 현대춤의 반향. 『무용예술학연구』, 54: 1-19.
- 김연희(2012). 예술과정으로 본 창의성의 기원. 『미학』, 70: 35-73.
- 정순복(1990). 존 듀이의 철학에 있어서 '질성'과 예술의 문제. 『미학』, 15: 113-148.
- _____ (2005). 존 듀이의 예술철학: 형성과정, 방법론적 토대 및 예술의 본질. 『미학』, 44: 93-114.
- Ecker, D(1963). The Artistic Process as Qualitative Problem Solving. *J.A.A.C.*, 21(3): 283-290.
- Jeong, Soon-bok(1990). On the problem of qualitiveness and Arts in John Dewey's philosophy. *Aesthetics*, 15: 113-148.
- _____ (1996). The Metaphor of Art in John Dewey's Metaphysics. *Aesthetics*, 21: 167-194.
- _____ (2005). John Dewey's Art Philosophy: Its Formative context, Methodological Basis and the Essence of Art. *Aesthetics*, 44: 93-113.
- Beardsley, M. C.(1965). On the Creation of Art. *J.A.A.C.*, 23(3): 291-304.
- Kim, Yeon-hee(2012). The Origin of Creativity in Artistic Process. *Aesthetics*, 70: 35-73.

논문투고일 2016. 5. 13.

심사일 2016. 5. 22.

심사완료일 2016. 5. 27.

무용창조에서의 질적인 사유

김 말 북

이화여자대학교 무용과 교수

본 연구는 무용창조에서 드러나는 예술적 사유의 특성을 설명하고자하는 목적을 지닌다. 안무자들이 지적인 사유나 정신적 판단 없이 예술적 창조를 하는 것은 아니지만 대다수의 철학자들은 무용에서 어떤 개념이나 이론을 발견할 수 없다는 이유로 무용의 지적 가치를 폄하하는 경향이 있어 왔다. 따라서 본 연구는 무용창조과정에서 발견되는 사유의 특성을 미국 철학자 존 듀이(John Dewey, 1859~1952)의 ‘질적인 사유(qualitative thought)’의 개념을 빌어 설명한다. 논의의 관건은 무용작품을 사유의 결과 즉 사유체로 볼 수 있느냐하는 것이다. 하지만 그보다 먼저 지적되고 설명되어야할 것은 무용창조과정에서 드러나는 예술적 사유의 특성이다. 따라서 듀이의 사상적 영향아래 예술창조에 관한 뛰어난 연구를 한 비어즐리(M. C. Beardsley)와 제랄드 마이어스(Gerald Myers)의 ‘움직임의 질(movement quality)’개념을 중심으로 무용에서 발견되는 질적 존재적 특성을 지적한 뒤 안무자들이 무용창조과정에서 자신들의 매체를 다루고 사유하는 과정에서 나타나는 무용 사유의 대상과 특성을 설명하였다.

키워드: 질적 사유(Qualitative thinking), 존 듀이(John Dewey), 무용창조(Dance creation), 움직임 특질 (Movement quality), 제랄드 마이어스(Gerald Meyers)

